

1911.

VICTORIA.

---

PROGRESS REPORT

FROM

THE PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE  
ON RAILWAYS

ON THE

PORTLAND AND SERVICETON MAIN LINE  
CONNEXION RAILWAY;

TOGETHER WITH

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE AND PLAN.

---

*Ordered by the Legislative Assembly to be printed, 19th December, 1911.*

---

By Authority:

J. KEMP, GOVERNMENT PRINTER, MELBOURNE.

EXTRACTED FROM THE VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY.

---

THURSDAY, 25TH FEBRUARY, 1909.

- 6 PORTLAND AND SERVICETON MAIN LINE CONNEXION RAILWAY.—Mr. A. A. Billson moved, pursuant to notice, That the question of providing direct railway communication to the sea-board at Portland from districts between the South Australian border line and the existing railway from Murtoa to Hopetoun, and the provision of a deficiency rate, be referred to the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Railways for inquiry and report.

Question—put and resolved in the affirmative.

---

FRIDAY, 8TH DECEMBER, 1911.

5. LINES OF RAILWAY REFERRED TO STANDING COMMITTEE.—Mr. A. A. Billson moved, pursuant to notice, That the following questions be referred to the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Railways for consideration and report :—

- (1) The question of providing direct railway communication to the sea-board at Portland from districts between the South Australian Border line and the existing railway from Murtoa to Hopetoun.

\* \* \* \* \*

Debate ensued.

Question—put and resolved in the affirmative.

---

MEMBERS OF THE PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON RAILWAYS.

(Tenth Committee.)

The Hon. E. H. CAMERON, M.L.A., Chairman ;

J. W. Billson, Esq., M.L.A.,  
The Hon. Dr. W. H. Embling, M.L.C.,  
W. Hutchinson, Esq., M.L.A.,

The Hon. D. Melville, M.L.C.  
(Vice-Chairman),  
E. C. Warde, Esq., M.L.A.

---

APPROXIMATE COST OF REPORT.

Compilation *	£	..	..
Printing (700 copies)	..	..	6 0 0

\* The compilation was a portion of the work of the Secretary of the Railways Standing Committee, who is paid by annual salary.

## PROGRESS REPORT.

THE PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON RAILWAYS, to which the Legislative Assembly referred the question of providing direct railway communication to the sea-board at Portland from districts between the South Australian border line and the existing railway from Murtoa to Hopetoun, has the honour to report as follows:—

1. About two years ago the Committee visited Hamilton, Coleraine, Casterton, and the districts to the north as far as the Horsham-Serviceton main line, and received evidence concerning the question of providing direct railway communication between the Wimmera and Southern Mallee districts and the sea-board at Portland, with the object of making that port the place of shipment for all grain, frozen meat, wool, fruit, hides, and dairy produce exported to over-sea countries or to the neighbouring States, instead of being conveyed a longer distance by rail to Geelong or Melbourne for shipment. Early in 1910, however, when the Committee was preparing to examine the Railways Commissioners concerning the proposal to divert this trade to Portland, it was asked by the Honorable the Premier to co-operate with a Royal Commission appointed by the South Australian Government to inquire into the question of constructing a railway from the Portland-Hamilton line to Mount Gambier, and another from the terminus of the Horsham-Goroke railway westwards to junction with the South Australian railway system at Frances. The object of the first-mentioned proposal was to give the producers in the Mount Gambier district direct railway communication with a deep-sea port at Portland, and the intention of the second project was to divert the wheat and wool traffic of the Wimmera and Southern Mallee districts to the South Australian railways for export at Kingston. As the latter proposal clashed with the question of direct railway communication between the Wimmera district and Portland, the Committee had no option but to postpone dealing with that subject until the Inter-State Royal Commission on Border Railways had come to a decision regarding the suggested Goroke-Frances connecting line, and the probable diversion of the Wimmera trade to Kingston. When it was ascertained, a few months ago, that the Commission was not likely to approve of the Goroke-Frances connexion, the Committee wrote to the Victorian Railways Commissioners for information concerning the volume of the goods and live stock traffic from the Wimmera-Serviceton district, and asking what proportion of that traffic was consigned to Melbourne, Geelong, and Portland respectively, the amount of local or wayside trade likely to be obtained by a direct railway from the Wimmera-Serviceton district through either Hamilton or Casterton to Portland, and the cost of providing the necessary train service, and maintaining the connecting line. This information did not reach the last (Ninth) Committee till towards the end of October, 1911, and it therefore had no opportunity, before the dissolution of Parliament, of questioning Mr. W. Fitzpatrick, Chairman of the Commissioners, regarding the figures supplied to the Committee, and the probable trend of traffic if a direct railway from the Wimmera district to Portland were constructed. Neither has the present Committee during the few days since its appointment had an opportunity of hearing the views of Mr. Fitzpatrick on these matters. Nevertheless, the members of the present Committee, with the exception of Mr. Hutchinson, M.L.A., having inspected the country traversed by the proposed railway routes, and heard all the local evidence, considered that the information obtained should be made available, and that the Committee should express its views on the various proposals as far as the circumstances would permit.

### ROUTES ADVOCATED.

2. One of the proposals brought under the notice of the Committee was a line starting in the Southern Mallee on the north side of the Horsham-Serviceton main line, in the Broughton farming district, and running south-west about 17 miles to Kaniva, on the main line, and continuing southwards across the Little Desert, and through the

agricultural and grazing districts of Minimay, Lemon Springs, and Boorookpi, and thence to Edenhope, Kadnook, Chetwynd, and Casterton. It was suggested by some of the residents in the valley of the Glenelg that the line, on reaching Edenhope, should, instead of turning south-east to Chetwynd, be carried southwards to Dergholm, on that river, and thence to Casterton, so as to serve the fertile flats in the valley of the Glenelg. At the time of the visit of the Committee to the district the river was in flood, and the greater part of the flats bordering on its banks were under water. Although Broughton is about 17 miles north-east of Kaniva, it is a little nearer to Miram, on the Serviceton main line. The wheat-growers there stated that they not only wanted the railway brought nearer to them, so as to save the time and expense of carting to Kaniva or Miram, and enable them to give more attention to the working of their fallow land, but they also wished to decrease the railway rates for the haulage of grain to a seaport by shortening the distance. They said that the distance from Kaniva to Melbourne *viâ* Geelong, which was the route by which their grain was taken, was  $296\frac{1}{2}$  miles, and the railway rate 13s. 4d. per ton, while the distance to Geelong was  $253\frac{1}{2}$  miles, and the rate 12s. 8d. On the other hand, from Kaniva, *viâ* Edenhope, Chetwynd, and Casterton, to Portland, would be but 172 miles, and the railway rate on agricultural produce 10s. 9d., provided ordinary through mileage rates, and not local rates, were charged for the haulage over the new line from Kaniva to Casterton. If local rates were imposed the rate to Portland would be 15s. 9d. per ton, or much more than the rates to either Geelong or Melbourne, while the rate to Portland by way of the existing railways through Ararat and Hamilton would be but 12s. 10d. The charging of local rates over the new line would, therefore, prevent any through traffic in grain, and render the connexion an unprofitable undertaking. It was urged, however, by the advocates of the Broughton-Kaniva-Casterton line that the railway would be a paying one from the start, and consequently there would be no need to impose local rates. In support of this assertion they stated that, in addition to large quantities of grain being sent over the new line, there would be many trucks of live stock, especially fat lambs intended for freezing and export at Portland, and there would also be fertilizers and cornsacks, and, in time, a large tonnage annually of stores and general merchandise carried from Portland to the Serviceton district, besides potatoes and root crops from the Casterton and Chetwynd district, and stone for road-making and paving from the granite and limestone quarries at Moree and Connewerricoo, near Chetwynd. Moreover, the shorter distance which the wheat would have to be taken by rail to the sea-board at Portland would allow the trucks to do more trips, and haul a larger quantity of grain in the busy season, thus assisting both the farmers and the Railway Department. Wheat is purchased at country railway stations at the ruling price in Melbourne, less the cost of railage from there to the metropolis, and the farmers at Broughton and elsewhere in the Wimmera-Serviceton district believed that, if they could secure direct railway connexion with Portland, grain-buyers would export from that port, and, having less railage to pay on wheat sent to Portland, they would give the farmers a slightly better price, perhaps  $\frac{3}{4}$ d. or  $\frac{1}{2}$ d. per bushel more, than they could do if the grain had to be despatched to Melbourne for shipment. In dealing later on with the question of constructing a direct line to Portland, the Committee will give consideration to this aspect of the matter. But, in the meantime, it may be stated that the evidence showed that, when wheat was purchased at country stations at the Melbourne market price less the railway charges to Victoria Dock or Williamstown, and afterwards shipped at Geelong, the buyer did not hand to the farmer the saving made in the railway rate by exporting the wheat at Geelong instead of at Melbourne.

3. Going southwards from Kaniva the Committee found that the proposed railway was regarded solely from the stand-point of a line to meet local requirements, and not as a through or "national" railway. Most of the farmers at Minimay and Boorookpi were indifferent as to the route of the line, whether it was southwards from Kaniva to Casterton or eastwards to Goroke and thence southwards from Noradjuha to Hamilton, so long as railway facilities were brought nearer to them. Around Minimay some of the land is crab-hole, and here and there are areas which seemed rather too wet for wheat-growing. Southwards, towards Ullswater and Edenhope, the country is better adapted for cereals, the soil being more loamy. Towards Harrow, however, some poor, sandy heath and honeysuckle country was passed through. Approaching Kadnook the land improves

in quality, being well grassed, open redgum country. There are patches of good soil near Chetwynd, and some small areas of inferior land, but at Wando Vale, a few miles north of Casterton, the country is fertile and closely settled. Between Dergholm and Casterton some poor country was passed through, back from the Glenelg River, though at the former place good arable land was seen. Mr. M. E. Kernot, Chief Engineer for Railway Construction, informed the Committee that a broad-gauge railway from Casterton through Chetwynd, Edenhope, and Goroke to Kaniva would be 102 miles in length, and would cost approximately £337,000 to construct, exclusive of land and rolling-stock. The country from Casterton to Chetwynd and on to the Glenelg was rough and hilly, necessitating a ruling grade of 1 in 40. No survey or inspection had been made of the route from Edenhope through Boorookpi and Minimay to Kaniva. It would, however, be a few miles shorter, perhaps 6 or 7, but would make little, if any, difference in the rates for the carriage of grain to Portland stated in the preceding paragraph. Mr. Kernot pointed out that if the railway were made through Boorookpi the Goroke line would necessarily have to be extended to that place, so as to give the connexion with Portland. The alternative route from Casterton through Dergholm to Edenhope would be about the same length and cost as the Chetwynd proposal. The further extension of 17 miles from Kaniva to Broughton was estimated to cost £46,000. He explained that all the estimates had been roughly taken out for the purpose of comparison, and that more survey work was necessary before reliable figures as to the cost of the various routes could be supplied.

4. Another proposed connecting railway was from Horsham southwards through Brimpaen, Glenisla (in the Victoria Valley), and Cavendish to Hamilton. This suggested connexion would be  $75\frac{1}{2}$  miles in length, and would have a ruling grade of 1 in 50. Its estimated cost was £248,416. An alternative route was an extension of the Noradjuha line southwards from Toolondo through Balmoral, and junctioning with the Coleraine and Hamilton line near Wannou. The length of this line from Toolondo to Wannou would be 48 miles, and the cost £212,000 for a line with a ruling grade of 1 in 40. A further proposal was that the Toolondo route on reaching Balmoral, instead of proceeding south to Wannou, should follow the road from Balmoral south-east to Cavendish, and thence southward to Hamilton. The length of this line would be 47 miles, and the estimated cost £231,000 for a line with a ruling grade of 1 in 40. It was urged in support of the Horsham-Glenisla-Cavendish route that it would be the most direct connexion between the Wimmera-Southern Mallee districts and Portland, and that it would have the easiest grade, which was important if the through traffic was to be of large dimensions. Furthermore, it would make available for wheat-growing a large area of private land near Brimpaen and Rosebrook, and would also enable large quantities of redgum sleepers, piles, and bridge timbers required by the Railway Department for the renewal of the Wimmera and Western District railways, as well as the Adelaide main line, to be obtained from the Victoria State forest at a less price than is now paid by the Department for such supplies. The Committee ascertained from the Railways Commissioners that, if this through line from Horsham to Hamilton were constructed, the saving to the Department in the cost of the sleepers and timbers referred to would amount to about £4,000 or £5,000 annually. A report obtained from Mr. H. R. Mackay, Conservator of Forests, showed that the proposed through railway would serve 12,000 acres of splendid redgum fit for the saw and hewing in the northern part of Victoria Valley, and about 40,000 acres of Crown lands, occupied under section 35 of the *Land Act* 1901 as grazing areas, on the east slope of the Black Range, where there were fine supplies of redgum, grey box, yellow box, white ironbark, and stringybark. In his opinion, the timber available should meet the requirements of the Railway Department for the next twelve or fifteen years, without reckoning the timber which would mature during that period. Taking the whole of the hardwood timber available on private lands, and also on Crown lands held under lease and on forest reserves, the output of sleepers should be over two millions. Mr. Mackay was of opinion that the estimates furnished by the Railway Department of the saving in haulage and the consequent saving in expenditure arising from the carriage of timber from these forest areas over the proposed line was a reasonable one and well within the mark. On the other hand, it was stated that if the Toolondo line were extended southward to Hamilton it would be the least costly connexion to make, and would lead to the cultivation of country around Fulham and Balmoral and west and south-west of the latter town towards Harrow and Nareen, which the Horsham-Glenisla-Cavendish route would not serve. Mr. Kernot informed the

Horsham and  
Hamilton  
connexion.

Committee that the 1 in 40 grades on the Hamilton-Cavendish-Balmoral route, and on the Wannon-Balmoral survey, could be reduced to 1 in 50 the same as on the Cavendish-Glenisla-Horsham line, but the curves were sharper and the grades longer on the Wannon route, and consequently the cost of reducing them would be more than on the Hamilton-Cavendish-Balmoral line, and there would still be 1 in 40 and 1 in 43 grades on the Wannon-Hamilton railway. He added that the Balmoral-Wannon connexion would not only be 4 miles longer to construct than the Balmoral-Cavendish route, but it would increase the length of haulage into Hamilton by 12 miles, which would handicap it as a direct connecting railway compared with the Cavendish proposal.

Kaniva-Casterton connexion.

5. Dealing with the three proposals as connecting railways so as to give the Wimmera and Southern Mallee farmers a direct route to the sea-board at Portland, the Committee had no hesitation in setting aside the Broughton-Kaniva-Casterton proposal, as it would be of service to only a narrow strip of settled country on either side of the Nhill-Serviceton main line, whereas either the Horsham-Glenisla-Cavendish route or the Toolondo-Balmoral-Cavendish line would drain all the wheat-growing country from Nhill eastwards through Horsham to Murtoa, and also the lands served by the Rainbow, Lorquon, and Hopetoun branch railways. The distance from Nhill to Portland, *via* Kaniva, Edenhope, and Casterton, would be  $196\frac{1}{2}$  miles, while from Nhill by way of Horsham, Glenisla, and Hamilton it would be but  $177\frac{3}{4}$  miles, and  $182\frac{1}{2}$  by the Toolondo-Cavendish route. Nevertheless, a section of the Broughton-Casterton proposal—from the latter town northwards through Wando Vale, Chetwynd, and Kadnook to Edenhope—is worthy of being further inquired into as a line to meet local requirements. From the inspection of the country and the evidence received, the Committee came to the conclusion that if a railway were to be made that route would be preferable to the suggested Dergholm proposal, but, in the absence of any figures from the Railways Commissioners as to the probable revenue and working expenses, the Committee could not say whether such a line would be justified. Mr. Kernot was questioned by the Committee as to the cost of extending the Casterton railway northwards through Wando Vale and Chetwynd to near the junction of the Chetwynd and Glenelg Rivers, or carrying the Coleraine line north-west towards Wando Dale and on to the same point. He said both routes would have a ruling grade of 1 in 40, and there would not be much difference in the cost per mile of the two lines, both running into probably £5,000 a mile, but, as the Coleraine extension would be  $38\frac{1}{2}$  miles in length as against 31 miles for the Casterton route, it would be the more expensive line. The inquiry into the proposed extension of the Lorquon railway westwards to Yanac-a-Yanac will enable the question of serving the Mallee lands to the north of Broughton to be further dealt with.

#### HORSHAM TO HAMILTON DIRECT RAILWAY.

6. The Traffic Officers (Mr. C. Barber and Mr. J. S. Mitchell) of the Railway Department, who visited the district lying between Horsham and Hamilton along the Glenisla route, reported that a railway joining those two towns would serve about 700,000 acres around Cavendish, Glenisla, and Brimpaen, including 160,000 acres of forest reserves. Of the total area, a little less than a third was fair arable land, the remainder being fit for grazing purposes only. The area under wheat last year amounted to 7,300 acres. During the present season a considerable increase in cultivation has taken place on account of the subdivision and settlement of the Mooralla and Kenilworth estates, comprising 35,500 acres, adjacent to Cavendish. These estates were acquired by the Lands Purchase and Management Board, and were divided into 55 farm allotments and 16 agricultural labourers' allotments. The officers mentioned estimated the local tonnage likely to be offered for transport over a through line from Horsham, *via* Glenisla and Cavendish to Hamilton during the first twelve months it is open for traffic as follows:—Agricultural produce, 8,000 tons; sawn and split timber, 10,000 tons; firewood, 6,000 tons; wool, 700 tons; and general goods, 500 tons, including honey, bark, hides, skins, &c. The inwards tonnage to the district was estimated by them at 2,500 tons. The population along the route of this railway was put down at 2,000 persons, and the number of horses at 1,951, cattle 2,738, sheep 208,212, and pigs 213.

7. The Railways Commissioners furnished the Committee with the following estimates of annual expenses and revenue for a connecting railway from Horsham to Hamilton by way of Glenisla and Cavendish, providing for one train each way per day :—

#### ANNUAL CHARGES.

Interest at 4 per cent. per annum on £259,376, being the estimated cost (£248,416) of constructing 75½ miles of 5ft. 3in. railway from Horsham to Hamilton, <i>viâ</i> Glenisla and Cavendish, with £10,960 added for rolling-stock	£10,375	0	10
Traffic expenses .. .. .	1,095	7	9
Maintenance charges .. .. .	5,058	10	0
Locomotive expenses, including repairs and renewals of rolling-stock .. .. .	4,078	19	7
General charges .. .. .	255	16	5
<b>Total annual charges .. .. .</b>	<b>£20,863</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>7</b>

#### REVENUE.

(Based on local rates on all goods except timber and firewood carried over the new line.)

	On New Line.	On other Lines from New Traffic from New Line.	
Passengers.. .. .	£1,691 4 5 ..	£200 0 0	
Parcels .. .. .	340 0 0 ..	..	
Mails .. .. .	566 5 0 ..	..	
Class goods .. .. .	1,450 0 0 ..	60 0 0	
Wool .. .. .	262 10 0 ..	..	
Live stock .. .. .	305 0 0 ..	60 0 0	
Timber and firewood	2,250 0 0 ..	1,000 0 0	
Grain .. .. .	1,300 0 0 ..	1,100 0 0	
Manures .. .. .	218 15 0 ..	..	
All other traffic .. .. .	200 0 0 ..	..	
	<hr/>	<hr/>	
	£8,583 14 5	£2,420 0 0	£11,003 14 5
<b>Estimated annual loss .. .. .</b>	<b>..</b>	<b>..</b>	<b>£9,860 0 2</b>

8. It was ascertained by the Committee that the foregoing estimates of revenue did not include any income from through traffic in wheat, flour, live stock, &c., which the advocates of this connecting railway said would be despatched from the Wimmera and Southern Mallee districts over the line to Portland for shipment there, nor did it give the line any credit for any flour, bran, pollard, or live stock now sent from those districts by way of Ararat to Hamilton and to stations on the Portland, Casterton, Coleraine, and Warrnambool railways, and which would be carried over the proposed line if it were constructed, nor for any potatoes, onions, or general merchandise which might be sent from the Warrnambool and Portland districts to Horsham, or to towns in the Southern Mallee. As previously stated, the last Committee had no opportunity, between the date on which it received the estimate of traffic and the dissolution of Parliament, to question the Railways Commissioners on these and other necessary matters, and consequently it could not arrive at any decision regarding the construction of the suggested connexion between Horsham and Hamilton, or whether the route should be by way of Glenisla or *viâ* Balmoral in the event of a through railway being considered necessary. These matters will be considered by the present Committee at an early date.

9. A report was also obtained from the Traffic Officers concerning the construction of a section—from Horsham southwards to Brimpaen—of the proposed through line. This section would be 27 miles in length, and was estimated to cost £68,300 to construct as a light line, which could subsequently be strengthened in the event of it being made part of the suggested Horsham to Hamilton connecting railway. Such a line to Brimpaen would serve approximately 350,000 acres, including 100,000 acres of forest reserves. The area of agricultural land which would be within reasonable access of the line was estimated at 150,000 acres, of which 4,000 acres were under crop last season. The tonnage likely to be carried over this line during the first twelve months it is open was set down as follows :—Agricultural produce, 3,000 tons; timber, 5,000 tons;

firewood, 4,000 tons; wool, 200 tons; and general goods, including honey, skins, and wattle bark, 200 tons. The population in the district was estimated at 700 persons. The annual charges would, it was thought, come to £7,056, and the revenue to £4,224, leaving a deficit of £2,832.

#### HAMILTON TO CAVENDISH RAILWAY.

10. Mr. Kernot informed the Committee that a broad-gauge railway branching off the Coleraine line about  $4\frac{1}{4}$  miles from Hamilton railway station and proceeding in a northerly direction as surveyed to Cavendish would be  $14\frac{1}{2}$  miles in length, and would cost £53,985 to construct, with a ruling grade of 1 in 50. To bring the Cavendish line in on its own set of rails to the existing junction of the Coleraine and Portland railways, about  $\frac{3}{4}$  of a mile from the Hamilton station, would cost about £11,200 additional. An inspection of the country had shown that the proposed Cavendish line could junction with the Hamilton and Ararat railway about  $1\frac{3}{4}$  miles from the former station. The length and cost of this route to Cavendish would be about the same as the other route, but the cost of bringing the line on its own set of rails into the Hamilton station yard would be but £6,500. In neither estimate, however, was any provision made for additional accommodation at the Hamilton station. The Traffic Officers reported that about 250,000 acres, including 20,000 acres of forest reserves, would be benefited by the Hamilton to Cavendish line, and that the arable land within that area was approximately 100,000 acres. During the present season 6,000 acres around Cavendish were under wheat. The tonnage likely to be carried over this railway during the first twelve months it is open for traffic was estimated as follows:—Agricultural produce, 5,000 tons; timber, 5,000 tons; firewood, 2,000 tons; wool, 500 tons; and general goods, including honey, hides, skins, and wattle bark, 400 tons. The probable inwards tonnage was set down at 1,750 tons. The population of the district was estimated at 1,300 persons, and the number of horses at 608, cattle 1,045, sheep 80,151, pigs 54.

11. The Railways Commissioners furnished the Committee with the following estimates of annual charges and revenue for a broad-gauge railway from Hamilton to Cavendish, providing for a service of one train each way per day:—

#### ANNUAL CHARGES.

Interest at 4 per cent. per annum on £63,195, being the estimated cost (£53,985) of constructing $14\frac{1}{2}$ miles of 5ft. 3in. railway from Hamilton to Cavendish, with £9,210 added for rolling-stock	..	..	..	£2,527	16	0
Traffic expenses	..	..	..	560	6	7
Maintenance charges	..	..	..	971	10	0
Locomotive expenses, including repairs and renewals of rolling-stock	..	..	..	1,296	13	4
General charges	..	..	..	70	13	9
<b>Total annual charges</b>	..	..	..	<b>£5,426</b>	<b>19</b>	<b>8</b>

#### REVENUE.

(Based on local rates for the carriage of all goods except timber and firewood over the new line.)

	On New Line.	On other Lines from New Traffic from New Line.	
Passengers..	£938 17 9	£120 0 0	
Parcels ..	160 0 0	..	
Mails ..	108 15 0	..	
Class goods ..	700 5 0	30 0 0	
Wool ..	168 15 0	..	
Live stock ..	50 0 0	30 0 0	
Timber and firewood	875 0 0	500 0 0	
Agricultural produce	625 0 0	550 0 0	
Manures ..	109 7 6	..	
All other traffic ..	80 0 0	..	
	<b>£3,816 0 3</b>	<b>£1,230 0 0</b>	<b>£5,046 0 3</b>
<b>Estimated annual loss</b>	..	..	<b>£380 19 5</b>



12. It was explained that the estimated working expenses of the foregoing lines did not include any provision for the staff necessary to operate the junctions with the existing lines near Hamilton and Horsham, and that the Railways Commissioners considered that any new lines should not junction with main lines, but should, for safety, be brought into the station yards on their own set of rails.

#### RECOMMENDATION.

13. The Committee, being of opinion that railway extension to Cavendish will result in further estates near there, and in the direction of Balmoral, being brought under cultivation, and so reduce the estimated annual loss on the line, recommends the construction of a railway from Hamilton northwards to Cavendish, about 16 miles, at a cost of approximately £60,500, starting from the Hamilton station yard, on the Ararat side, if a survey of the inspected route proves that the line can be made for that sum. This extension will be along the best route, both for the grade and for shortness of the through mileage, should it be decided later on to recommend a connecting railway between Horsham and Hamilton either by way of Brimpaen and Glenisla or *viâ* Toolondo and Balmoral.

E. H. CAMERON,  
Chairman.

Railways Standing Committee Room,  
State Parliament House,  
Melbourne, 19th December, 1911.

[*Minutes of Evidence are not printed.*]