

1910.

VICTORIA.

REPORT

FROM

**THE PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE
ON RAILWAYS**

ON THE QUESTION OF THE PROPOSED

**BLACK ROCK, BEAUMARIS, AND MENTONE
CONNECTING RAILWAY;**

TOGETHER WITH

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE AND PLAN.

Ordered by the Legislative Assembly to be printed, 19th December, 1910.

By Authority:

J. KEMP, GOVERNMENT PRINTER, MELBOURNE.

RAILWAYS STANDING COMMITTEE REPORT No. 8.—[9d.]—18264.

EXTRACTED FROM THE VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE
LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY.

WEDNESDAY, 20TH OCTOBER, 1909.

4. **BLACK ROCK AND BEAUMARIS CONNECTING RAILWAY.**—Mr. A. A. Billson moved, pursuant to notice, That the question of connecting the suburban districts of Black Rock and Beaumaris with the existing railway system by means of an electric or steam railway, and the provision of a deficiency rate, be referred to the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Railways for inquiry and report.

Debate ensued.

Question—put and resolved in the affirmative.

THURSDAY, 18TH AUGUST, 1910.

7. **SANDRINGHAM CONNECTING RAILWAY.**—Mr. A. A. Billson moved, pursuant to notice, That the question of constructing a line of railway from Sandringham to connect with the Caulfield and Mordialloc railway be referred to the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Railways, to take into consideration and report when dealing with the question of railway communication with Black Rock and Beaumaris.

Debate ensued.

Question—put and resolved in the affirmative.

MEMBERS OF THE PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON RAILWAYS.

(Ninth Committee.)

The Hon. E. H. CAMERON, M.L.A., Chairman ;

J. W. Billson, Esq., M.L.A.,
J. Cullen, Esq., M.L.A.,
The Hon. Dr. W. H. Embling, M.L.C.,

The Hon. D. Melville, M.L.C.
(Vice-Chairman),
E. C. Warde, Esq., M.L.A.

APPROXIMATE COST OF REPORT.

											£ s. d.	
Compilation.*												
Printing (700 copies)	-	10 0 0

* The compilation was a portion of the work of the Secretary of the Railways Standing Committee, who is paid by annual salary.

REPORT.

THE PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON RAILWAYS, to which the Legislative Assembly referred the question of connecting the suburban districts of Black Rock and Beaumaris with the existing railway system by means of an electric or steam railway, and the provision of a deficiency rate, and also the further question of constructing a line of railway from Sandringham to connect with the Caulfield and Mordialloc railway, has the honour to report as follows :—

1. Black Rock and Beaumaris are popular seaside resorts and residential areas Description of district. on the shores of Port Phillip, between Sandringham and Mordialloc. A strip of land varying in width from about 2 to 5 chains has been permanently reserved along the foreshore all the way from Sandringham to beyond Beaumaris, and the ti-tree growing on that strip has been preserved, making the beach an attractive place for picnic parties and holiday-makers. The greater part of this reserve is from 25 to 40 feet above sea level, so that a commanding view can be obtained from it over the eastern portion of Port Phillip, and of the movements of vessels passing up and down the bay. At Black Rock the country gradually ascends on going inland, affording further extensive views of the bay and the surrounding country. The soil is sandy, and easily drained. Most of the land in that locality has either been built on or has been purchased in small blocks for residential purposes, and, it was stated, would be so used if better means of conveyance were provided. There is a dip in the country between Black Rock and Beaumaris, but the land rapidly ascends at Balcombe-road, and also around Beaumaris. Both these localities have also a number of elevated sites suitable for suburban residences. The township of Beaumaris extends from Rickett's Point to Table Point, which jut into Port Phillip. After passing the latter point, going eastwards, the bay takes a sweep northwards towards Mentone, which is served to some extent by the existing railway from Mordialloc to Melbourne. The number of dwellings at Black Rock, which would be served by the proposed stations at Edward-street, Bluff-road, and Balcombe-road, was stated to be 230, and evidence was given that while buildings were being constantly erected in that district, the residences would rapidly increase in number if railway facilities were provided so as to allow the residents to get to and from Melbourne in a reasonable time, and at convenient intervals throughout the day, and also with that comfort which is associated with suburban train travelling. There is very little settlement between Black Rock and Beaumaris. It was stated that at the latter township there were close on fifty residences, and while Beaumaris, because of its natural beauty and other advantages, offered attractive sites for residential purposes, the public were loath to avail themselves of these advantages, owing to the absence of cheap and rapid facilities for reaching the city. The only means of conveyance Beaumaris has is a horse tramway, which starts at Beach-road, about 10 or 12 chains from the Sandringham Railway Station, and runs along Beach-road (adjoining the foreshore reserve) past Black Rock and on to Beaumaris, and thence to the Cheltenham Railway Station. This horse tram, it was said, does not run at sufficiently frequent intervals to attract permanent residents at Beaumaris. It is also a slow means of conveyance, and the fares are higher than would be charged on the railway. Similar complaints regarding this tramway were made by those living at Black Rock. Both they and those residing at Beaumaris urged an extension of the Brighton and Sandringham steam railway through Black Rock with stations near Edward-street and Bluff-road, and thence south-eastwards to within 10 or 15 chains of Beaumaris township, with an intermediate station at Balcombe-road. There was a difference of opinion,

however, among the residents as to the route of the railway. Some wanted it kept as near to the beach as possible, without unduly interfering with the substantial residences fronting Beach-road or close thereto. These witnesses pointed out that by keeping the railway within a short distance of the foreshore it would add considerably to the picnic and holiday traffic, as the nearness of the stations to the bay would attract a larger number of visitors than if the railway were constructed half-a-mile or so back from the beach. It was stated that practically every week-day during the summer months family picnic parties visited Sandringham, and that they would go on to Black Rock and Beaumaris if the railway were kept close to the bay, as it would be more convenient for the children to reach the beach and the shady spots under the ti-tree growing along the foreshore reserve. Hundreds of adults also visited these seaside resorts on Saturdays and Sundays, and large crowds on public holidays. Other witnesses, however, who advocated the construction of the railway half-a-mile or so from the bay, stated that if the line were located more inland it would be a greater convenience to those who would be forced to build some distance from the beach, as future residential expansion would necessarily have to be away from the bay frontage, which was fairly well occupied at Black Rock, and also in the neighbourhood of Beaumaris. Furthermore, if the railway were constructed near the foreshore, it would draw traffic from one side only, but if it were built half-a-mile from the beach, there would be settlement on both sides of the line, and thus increase its revenue.

2. Two or three witnesses urged the construction of an electric street railway along either Beach road or in the reserve between that road and the foreshore. They contended that such a means of conveyance would avoid purchasing expensive property for the track of the steam railway and would be a much more popular route for visitors from the metropolis than a steam railway, as frequent glimpses of the bay would be obtained from the electric railway which could not be got from a steam train running some distance inland, where the view of Port Phillip would be obstructed by dwellings. Several objections, however, were raised by the Sandringham Railway Extension League against the construction of an electric railway instead of a steam one, and also to taking either an electric or steam railway along the beach or the reserve adjacent to the foreshore. These witnesses said that in the first place the time occupied in making the trip from Beaumaris to Sandringham by an electric street railway would be too long for those using it daily to reach the city, and that it would be expensive travelling, as there would be no periodical tickets issued for the street railway. In the next place, the Beach-road was now partly occupied by the horse tramway, and to also carry an electric railway along that road would not only impede the vehicular traffic, but would endanger the lives of children going to or from the beach. If the electric railway were run inside the ti-tree reserve it would necessitate the destruction of so many of the shelter trees as to rob the reserve and foreshore of much of their attraction. Moreover, there would still be the danger of the electric trains running down children or elderly people on their way to or from the beach. The local residents, it was stated, also desired to avoid the inconvenience of having to change from an electric railway to the steam train at Sandringham and *vice versa*, and the possibility of not being able to get a seat on the electric street railway during the summer evenings and afternoons, when the seaside traffic would be large. The shifting of luggage from the electric street railway to the steam train would also be a nuisance, and it was urged if a goods siding were provided at Black Rock and at Beaumaris the steam railway could largely supplement its earnings by carrying fuel, building materials, road metal, and general merchandise—traffic which the electric railway would not be likely to obtain. It was stated that the lease held by the company owning the horse tramway along Beach-road from Sandringham to Beaumaris would not expire for nine or ten years.

3. Evidence was heard at Mentone concerning the extension of the proposed Sandringham-Beaumaris steam railway from the latter town to the Mordialloc and Caulfield line. There was a difference of opinion among the local residents as to the route this connecting railway should take. Some of the witnesses urged that on leaving Beaumaris it should be kept as near to the foot of Charman-road as possible so as to allow a station to be placed there within a few yards of the foreshore. From that point they said the line should be extended through Mentone township in the vicinity

Electric street
railway.

Connecting
railway with
Mordialloc line.

of Naples-street and junction with the Mordialloc and Caulfield railway at Parker's-road, where it was proposed to build a station for the working of the junction points of the two lines, and for the convenience of those who had purchased land in the neighbourhood of Parker's-road, and who, it was stated, would build on their allotments if a railway station were provided there. The objection urged by some of the residents of Mentone to this route was that it would unduly lengthen the connecting line, necessitating altogether over a mile and three-quarters of construction, and it would have the serious disadvantage of going through the best of the property and the most occupied part of Mentone township, making the cost of acquiring the land for railway purposes a very expensive matter. A further objection to this route was that children residing near Mentone station would have to cross the proposed line on their way to the beach, and their lives would be endangered. The requirements, it was said, of the landowners near Parker's-road could be met by the erection of a new station on the existing railway, about mid-way between Mordialloc and Mentone. To overcome these difficulties it was suggested that the railway, on leaving Beaumaris, should be carried north-eastwards towards the intersection of Balcombe-road and Charman-road, and thence eastwards, junctioning with the Mordialloc and Caulfield line on the north side of the gates at Mentone station. This alternative route would be slightly over a mile and a quarter in length. The proposed connecting line could, it was urged, be used to relieve the traffic on the Caulfield railway, which was overcrowded in the busy hours of the mornings and evenings, and, besides being a convenience to the local residents, would provide a coast railway from Melbourne all the way to Frankston, which would be of value for defence purposes. It was pointed out, however, by the Railways Commissioners that it would be nearly 2 miles longer from Mentone to Flinders-street station by way of Beaumaris and Sandringham than *viâ* Caulfield, so that little if any inducement would be offered to Mentone and Mordialloc passengers to travel by the former route, and they added "the contention that the suggested extension would relieve the Caulfield route is scarcely worthy of note, inasmuch as if all the passengers who now travel from and to Mordialloc and Mentone used the proposed new line the trains on the Caulfield line would not be relieved to any appreciable extent and certainly would not be reduced in number."

4. It was ascertained that a single line of railway from Sandringham *viâ* Black Rock and Beaumaris, junctioning with the Mordialloc and Caulfield line on the north side of Mentone station, would cost £60,735 exclusive of land and rolling-stock, and that if the connexion were made at Parker's-road, about midway between Mordialloc and Mentone, the expenditure would come to £70,085, not including the cost of the property which would have to be purchased for the track of the railway. As neither of the suggested connexions are required for departmental purposes and as there would be comparatively little traffic, except on Sundays and holidays, over this end of the suggested Sandringham-Mentone railway the Committee came to the conclusion that it was not expedient to construct a connecting line from Sandringham to the Mordialloc and Caulfield railway, and thereupon confined its attention to the question of extending the Sandringham railway to some point between that station and Reserve-road, close to Beaumaris.

5. The question arose as to whether the proposed extension of the Sandringham steam railway should be regarded as a "country" or an "urban" railway under the provisions of the *Railway Lands Acquisition Act* 1893. In the former case the district interested in a new line has to hand over to the Government free of charge the land required for railway purposes. But if the railway were an urban one within the meaning of the Act the Government would purchase the land, and the local municipal authority would have to guarantee the payment of so much of the interest on the sum expended in acquiring the land and in compensation by which the revenue of the line fell short after deducting from the receipts, the working and maintenance expenses, and also four per cent. interest on the cost of constructing the railway. The Committee consulted the Crown Solicitor on the matter, and he replied as follows:—"In the absence of a definition of an 'urban' district or 'country' district in the *Railway Lands Acquisition Act* 1893, it is difficult to say how the land is to be classed. 'Urban' in its strict sense would be confined to a town; by extension, I think, however, it might cover a place fairly thickly populated. The railway referred to is proposed to be constructed in what is classed as a shire under the Local Government

Connecting
railway.
Decision of
Committee.

Acquiring the
land for railway
purposes.

Act. The Act is confined to dividing land into country and urban districts, and it is difficult to say where the urban land ends and the country land begins. Sandringham is merging from the village into a township, but on the whole, I think, having regard to the fact that it is for Local Government purposes portion of a shire, and that settlement in the direction which the line is intended to take is sparse, that the line would be a country district within the Railway Lands Acquisition Act."

Cost of proposed railways.

6. Mr. Kernot, Chief Engineer for Railway Construction, informed the Committee that if the Sandringham steam railway were extended to Bluff-road, Black Rock, a length of $1\frac{1}{2}$ miles, the cost of the line and station buildings would be £19,080, exclusive of land and rolling-stock. This railway, which would be a single line, would run along the surface, and would necessitate the closing of several of the smaller streets by erecting the railway fence across them. At the crossings of the larger streets gates and gate-keepers would be provided. Provision was made for a station near Edward-street and for another on the west side of Bluff-road, Black Rock. It was suggested by residents of Black Rock that after passing Royal-avenue the railway should be swung eastwards and cross Bluff-road near the intersection of Fern-street, and that the station should be made at Bay-street, on the east instead of the west side of Bluff-road, so as to avoid the removal of dwellings near Black Rock township. Mr. Kernot, however, stated that if this alteration in the route were made it would cause the railway to be much more expensive, as there would have to be more earthworks on the east side of Bluff-road than if a line were kept on the west side of that thoroughfare. Moreover, the grade from Bay-street down to Balcombe-road would be a steep one, and in the construction of suburban railways it was the aim of the Railway Department to avoid such grades wherever possible. In common with the other suburban lines this extension would be laid with 80-lb. new steel rails. There would be an additional expenditure of £5,000 in making alterations and an island platform at the Sandringham station for this extension. The estimate for the purchase of land and compensation between Sandringham and Bluff-road was set down at £21,100. Mr. Kernot further stated that if the railway were carried half-a-mile further on to Balcombe-road the cost would be increased to £29,302, exclusive of land and rolling-stock and the £5,000 expenditure at Sandringham station. There would be a steel bridge to carry the railway over Bluff-road, and the quantity of earthworks on this half-mile of line would be more than double that on the mile and a half from Sandringham to Bluff-road, owing to the excavations between Bluff-road and Balcombe-road, and the cutting away of the hill on the north side of Balcombe-road, so as to widen out the station grounds and provide approaches thereto. The estimate for land purchase and compensation from Sandringham to the station at Balcombe-road was £22,400. He further informed the Committee that if the railway were carried on to Reserve-road, with the terminal station between it and Haydon's-road, the length of the line would be 2 miles 70 chains, and the estimated cost £35,835, exclusive of land and rolling-stock, and the outlay of £5,000 at Sandringham station. Land purchase and compensation would come to about £25,000 extra. Mr. Kernot stated that if the steam railway were extended still further on to the junction of Cromer-road with Esplanade-road (Beach-road), Beaumaris, the length from Sandringham would be 3 miles 49 chains, and the estimated cost for a single line of way would be £40,950, exclusive of land and rolling-stock and the £5,000 to be expended in alterations at Sandringham station. The land would cost about £27,000 additional. Provision was made in this estimate for a terminal station and three road-side stations. No allowance was made for closing or diverting the existing horse tramway at Beaumaris. He pointed out, however, there would be a difficulty in extending a railway with a terminal station near the junction of Cromer-road and Esplanade-road (Beach-road), as it could not, owing to the limited space between that station and the foreshore, be readily curved north-eastwards on passing over Cromer-road, so as to allow the line to be swung towards Charman-road, and thence to the Mordialloc and Caulfield railway.

Cost of electric street railway.

7. At the instance of the Committee, Mr. Kernot prepared estimates for the construction of an electric street railway from Sandringham station along Beach-road, to Cromer-road, Beaumaris. The length of this street railway would be $4\frac{1}{4}$ miles, and its approximate cost was put down at £44,400 for a single line of way with turn-outs. The gauge of the street railway would be 5ft. 3in. Included in the cost was £9,300 for six motor cars and five trailers, so as to provide, when necessary, a fifteen minute

service. The estimate also included £8,200 for the erection of a car-shed, power house, and plant. No allowance was made in the estimate for payment of any compensation to the company owning the horse tramway or for the utilization of any portion of its plant or rolling-stock.

8. The Traffic officers of the Railway Department (Messrs. C. H. Barber and J. S. Mitchell) who visited the district and made an estimate of the traffic over the proposed extensions stated that the area to be served by the line to Black Rock and on to Reserve-road was well suited for residential purposes. It was estimated by them that with railway facilities the population would increase by 100 per cent. by the time the extension was opened for traffic, as they were of opinion that simultaneously with the construction of the railway, building operations would be actively carried on at Black Rock and in the area beyond Balcombe-road towards Beaumaris. They estimated the outwards passenger traffic at 91,000 per annum for the extension to Bluff-road, Black Rock, with an intermediate station near Edward-street, and 96,000 for the line to Balcombe-road, and 101,000 if the railway were carried as far as Reserve-road. The number of outward passenger journeys from Sandringham last year was 600,000, but as the trip to the city and out again is regarded as two journeys the number of passengers travelling was in reality but 300,000. It will therefore be seen that the Traffic officers estimated the outwards passenger traffic from the Black Rock district at about one-third of the outward passenger traffic from Sandringham. The inwards passenger traffic was put down at 100,000 if the extension terminated at Bluff-road, Black Rock, 105,000 if it went on to Balcombe-road, and 110,000 if the railway were carried as far as Reserve-road. The inwards passenger traffic to Sandringham last year totalled 255,000, so that the Railway Department believes that 100,000 of these excursionists would go on to Black Rock and Beaumaris if the extension were made. The revenue from passenger traffic has been based, in accordance with the law, on "local" fares being charged over the extension, and 40 per cent. of the receipts over existing lines from the new traffic created by the extension has been credited to the new line. The fares from the Sandringham station to the station at Edward-street would be as follow :—1st class, single, 2d. ; return, 3d. ; 2nd class, single, 1d. ; return, 2d. From Sandringham to Bluff-road, Balcombe-road and Reserve-road the fares would be as follow :—1st class, single, 3d. ; return, 4½d. ; 2nd class, single, 2d. ; return, 3d. Monthly fares to Edward-street would be, 1st class, 28s. ; 2nd class, 21s. ; and to Bluff and Balcombe roads, 29s. 6d. and 22s. 6d. It was explained that the extension would have to be worked by a separate train, except on public holidays, when some of the trains to Sandringham would be run on to the terminus of the proposed extension. The reason for adopting this course was that the extension could under such circumstances be worked by a locomotive and four carriages, which would be sufficient for the passenger traffic except on holidays. The cost of this extra train would amount to £6,720, but if trains running from Flinders-street station to Sandringham had to be continued on to Black Rock or Reserve-road it would break into the existing train service between Melbourne, Brighton, and Sandringham, and would necessitate the employment of two additional trains, each consisting of a locomotive and eleven carriages, to maintain the existing service between Melbourne and Sandringham, and at the same time allow some of those trains to be run on to Black Rock and Reserve-road. The time-table which had been arranged for the proposed extension provided for 12 trains a day each way on week days, with 10 on Sundays and 20 on each public holiday. This was equal to the number of trains running daily on the Essendon and Broadmeadows line, and about the same as run from Mordialloc to Aspendale and Carrum, and on the Outer Circle railway to Deepdene and to Ashburton. In the opinion of the Traffic officers mentioned, the operation of "local" rates would prevent any goods traffic over the extension to either Black Rock or Reserve-road stations. These rates would have to be imposed in accordance with the law, and they ranged from 2s. a ton on coal, firewood, and bricks to 6s. a ton on furniture, house-fittings, &c. It was considered that under such circumstances, firewood dealers and builders would continue to consign their supplies of fuel, bricks, and other building materials to Sandringham and have them carted from there to Black Rock or the area towards Beaumaris, as the distance from Sandringham would not be more than a mile and a half to 3 miles. In estimating the working expenses no allowance was made for gate-keepers at the various street

crossings. It was explained that the Railway Department was compelled to erect gates on public roads only, such as appeared on the Government plans, and not across private streets which had been made by property owners or syndicates when subdividing their land into building allotments. If gate-keepers had to be provided at the crossings over the principal streets, probably seven or eight, the expenses for attendance at these gates would be from £497 to £671 a year, which would have to be added to the estimated annual loss, bringing it up to £1,625 in the case of a line terminating at Bluff-road, Black Rock, and about £2,680 if the railway were carried on to the north side of Balcombe-road, and about £3,790 if the extension went as far as Reserve-road.

Revenue and working expenses.

9. The Railways Commissioners estimated the annual revenue and working expenses for the proposed extension to Bluff-road (Black Rock), Balcombe-road and Reserve-road respectively for a service of 12 trains daily, each way, 10 on Sundays, and 20 on all public holidays, as follows :—

SANDRINGHAM TO BLUFF-ROAD, BLACK ROCK.

ANNUAL CHARGES.

Interest at 4 per cent. per annum on £30,800, being £24,080 the cost of constructing a single line of 5ft. 3in. railway from Sandringham to Bluff-road, Black Rock, a length of 1½ miles, with £6,720 added for rolling-stock	£1,232	0	0
Traffic expenses and station attendance	1,124	13	5
Maintenance charges	150	0	0
Locomotive expenses and repairs and replacement of rolling-stock	1,520	0	0
General expenses	69	17	5
Estimated annual charges	£4,096	10	10

REVENUE.

	On New Line.			On other Lines from New Traffic from New Line.						
Passengers	£2,215	1	2	...	£622	6	1
Parcels	100	0	0	...	10	0	0
Mails	11	5	0
All other traffic	10	0	0
				£2,336	6	2	...	£632	6	1
Estimated annual loss	£1,127	18	7

SANDRINGHAM TO BALCOMBE-ROAD.

ANNUAL CHARGES.

Interest at 4 per cent. per annum on £41,022, being £34,302 the cost of constructing a single line of 5ft. 3in. railway from Sandringham to the north side of Balcombe-road, a length of 2 miles, with £6,720 added for rolling-stock	£1,640	17	7
Traffic expenses and station attendance	1,520	5	5
Maintenance charges	200	0	0
Locomotive expenses and repairs and replacement of rolling-stock	1,773	10	8
General expenses	87	6	11
Estimated annual charges	£5,222	0	7

REVENUE.

	On New Line.			On other Lines from New Traffic from New Line.						
Passengers	£2,337	19	6	...	£653	9	7
Parcels	110	0	0	...	12	0	0
Mails	15	0	0
All other traffic	10	0	0
				£2,472	19	6	...	£665	9	7
Estimated annual loss	£3,133	9	1
				£2,083	11	6

SANDRINGHAM TO HAYDON'S AND RESERVE ROADS.

ANNUAL CHARGES.

Interest at 4 per cent. per annum on £47,555, being £40,835 the cost of constructing a single line of 5ft. 3in. railway from Sandringham to Reserve-road, a distance of 2¾ miles, with £6,720 added for rolling-stock	£1,902	4	0
Traffic expenses and station attendance	1,915	17	7
Maintenance charges	287	10	0
Locomotive expenses and repairs and replacement of rolling-stock	2,217	6	0
General expenses	110	12	4
Estimated annual charges	£6,433	9	11

REVENUE.

	On New Line.	On other Lines from New Traffic from New Line.	
Passengers	£2,460	£684	17 10 ... 13 1
Parcels	120	14	0 0 ... 0 0
Mails	22		10 0 ...
All other traffic	10		0 0 ...
	£2,613	£698	7 10 ... 13 1
Estimated annual loss			£3,312 0 11
			£3,121 9 0

As previously stated, the gate-keepers' wages, amounting to £497, £597, and £671 a year, were not included in any of the above estimates.

10. In answer to questions put by the Committee, witnesses, who urged the extension of the Sandringham railway, stated that the line from Brighton to that seaside town was opened just before the collapse of the boom in 1888, and that Sandringham made very little headway from then till 1900 owing to the depression which overtook the State in 1890 and continued for several years, necessitating economy in every direction, including the curtailment of expenditure on railway fares, and causing the suspension of building operations in all the outer suburbs. Since 1901-2, however, the revenue of the Sandringham railway had shown a considerable increase, the receipts at Sandringham station for that year being £4,193 while for 1909-10 they came to £11,984, indicating that with the return and continuance of prosperous seasons a number of the public preferred to reside away from the city and near to the seaside.

11. The Committee recommends the construction of a 5ft. 3in. steam railway from Sandringham to Bluff-road, Black Rock, a length of 1½ miles, at an estimated cost of £24,080, with £6,720 added for rolling-stock, provided that the local municipal council undertakes to levy a deficiency rate which will bring in £1,625 per annum to make good the estimated annual loss in connexion with the construction and operation of the railway from Sandringham to Bluff-road, Black Rock, or such lesser sum as may be required each year to make the railway a paying one. And, further, that the Council be required to hand over to the Government, free of charge, the land required for the railway track and station grounds in accordance with the provisions of Part I. of the *Railway Lands Acquisition Act 1893* relating to country railways. The sum of £1,625 to meet the first year's estimated loss to be lodged with the Honorable the Treasurer before the construction of the railway is entered upon.

12. The following extracts from the Minutes of the Proceedings of the Committee show the divisions which took place during the consideration of the question referred to it :—

THURSDAY, 15TH DECEMBER, 1910.

The Committee considered the question of connecting the districts of Black Rock and Beaumaris with the existing railway system by means of an electric or steam railway, and of constructing a railway from Sandringham to connect with the Caulfield and Mordialloc line.

After discussion—

Mr. J. W. Billson moved, That in the opinion of the Committee it is expedient to construct a 5ft. 3in. steam railway from Sandringham to Bluff-road, Black Rock, a length of 1½ miles, at an estimated cost of £24,080, with £6,720 added for rolling-stock, provided that the local municipal council undertakes to levy a deficiency rate which will bring in £1,625 per annum to make good the estimated annual loss in connexion with the construction and operation of the railway from Sandringham to Bluff-road, Black Rock, or such lesser sum as may be required each year to make the railway a paying one. And, further,

that that council be required to hand over to the Government, free of charge, the land required for the railway track and station grounds in accordance with the provisions of Part I. of the *Railway Lands Acquisition Act 1893* relating to country railways. The sum of £1,625 to meet the first year's estimated loss to be lodged with the Honorable the Treasurer before the construction of the railway is entered upon.

Mr. Melville moved, as an amendment, That all the words after "5ft. 3in." be omitted, with a view to insert in place thereof the words "electric street railway from Brighton along the Beach-road or in the reserve adjacent thereto to Black Rock and Beaumaris."

Question—That the words proposed to be omitted stand part of the motion—put.
The Committee divided.

Ayes, 4.
The Chairman,
Mr. J. W. Billson,
Mr. Cullen,
Mr. Warde.

Noes, 1.
Mr. Melville.

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the motion be agreed to—put.

Ayes, 3.
Mr. J. W. Billson,
Mr. Cullen,
Mr. Warde.

Noes, 2.
The Chairman,
Mr. Melville.

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

13. Section 5 of Act No. 1350 prohibits a member of the Committee taking part in the proceedings when any proposed line of railway in which he is personally interested is being considered or reported on by the Committee. Consequently the Honorable Dr. W. H. Embling, M.L.C., who is interested in property in the Black Rock district, did not take part in the deliberations of the Committee when the question of railway extension to Black Rock and Beaumaris was being decided.

E. H. CAMERON,
Chairman.

Railways Standing Committee Room,
State Parliament House,
Melbourne, 19th December, 1910.

[*Minutes of Evidence are not printed.*]