

PARLIAMENT OF VICTORIA

**PARLIAMENTARY DEBATES
(HANSARD)**

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

FIFTY-SEVENTH PARLIAMENT

FIRST SESSION

QUESTIONS ON NOTICE

Thursday, 19 September 2013

(Extract from book 12)

Internet: www.parliament.vic.gov.au/downloadhansard

By authority of the Victorian Government Printer

The Governor

The Honourable ALEX CHERNOV, AC, QC

The Lieutenant-Governor

The Honourable Justice MARILYN WARREN, AC

The ministry (from 22 April 2013)

Premier, Minister for Regional Cities and Minister for Racing	The Hon. D. V. Napthine, MP
Deputy Premier, Minister for State Development, and Minister for Regional and Rural Development	The Hon. P. J. Ryan, MP
Treasurer	The Hon. M. A. O'Brien, MP
Minister for Innovation, Services and Small Business, Minister for Tourism and Major Events, and Minister for Employment and Trade . .	The Hon. Louise Asher, MP
Attorney-General, Minister for Finance and Minister for Industrial Relations.	The Hon. R. W. Clark, MP
Minister for Health and Minister for Ageing	The Hon. D. M. Davis, MLC
Minister for Sport and Recreation, and Minister for Veterans' Affairs . . .	The Hon. H. F. Delahunty, MP
Minister for Education	The Hon. M. F. Dixon, MP
Minister for Planning	The Hon. M. J. Guy, MLC
Minister for Higher Education and Skills, and Minister responsible for the Teaching Profession	The Hon. P. R. Hall, MLC
Minister for Ports, Minister for Major Projects and Minister for Manufacturing	The Hon. D. J. Hodgett, MP
Minister for Multicultural Affairs and Citizenship, and Minister for Energy and Resources.	The Hon. N. Kotsiras, MP
Minister for Housing, and Minister for Children and Early Childhood Development	The Hon. W. A. Lovell, MLC
Minister for Public Transport and Minister for Roads	The Hon. T. W. Mulder, MP
Minister for Liquor and Gaming Regulation, Minister for Corrections and Minister for Crime Prevention	The Hon. E. J. O'Donohue, MLC
Minister for Local Government and Minister for Aboriginal Affairs.	The Hon. E. J. Powell, MP
Assistant Treasurer, Minister for Technology and Minister responsible for the Aviation Industry	The Hon. G. K. Rich-Phillips, MLC
Minister for Environment and Climate Change, and Minister for Youth Affairs.	The Hon. R. Smith, MP
Minister for the Arts, Minister for Women's Affairs and Minister for Consumer Affairs	The Hon. H. Victoria, MP
Minister for Agriculture and Food Security, and Minister for Water.	The Hon. P. L. Walsh, MP
Minister for Police and Emergency Services, and Minister for Bushfire Response	The Hon. K. A. Wells, MP
Minister for Mental Health, Minister for Community Services, and Minister for Disability Services and Reform	The Hon. M. L. N. Wooldridge, MP
Cabinet Secretary	Mr N. Wakeling, MP

Legislative Council committees

Privileges Committee — Ms Darveniza, Mr D. Davis, Mr P. Davis, Mr Hall, Ms Lovell, Ms Pennicuik and Mr Scheffer.

Procedure Committee — The President, Mr Dalla-Riva, Mr D. Davis, Mr Hall, Mr Lenders, Ms Pennicuik and Mr Viney

Legislative Council standing committees

Economy and Infrastructure Legislation Committee — Mr Barber, Mrs Coote, #Ms Crozier, Mr Drum, Mr Finn, #Ms Hartland, #Mr Leane, Mr Lenders, Mr Melhem, #Mr Ondarchie, Ms Pulford and Mr Ramsay.

Economy and Infrastructure References Committee — Mr Barber, Mrs Coote, #Ms Crozier, Mr Drum, Mr Finn, #Mr Leane, Mr Lenders, Mr Melhem, #Mr Ondarchie, Ms Pulford and Mr Ramsay.

Environment and Planning Legislation Committee — Mr Dalla-Riva, Mr Elsbury, #Mr Finn, #Ms Hartland, Mrs Kronberg, #Mr Leane, Mr Ondarchie, Ms Pennicuik, #Mrs Peulich, Mr Scheffer, #Mr Tarlamis, Mr Tee and Ms Tierney.

Environment and Planning References Committee — Mr Dalla-Riva, Mr Elsbury, #Mr Finn, #Ms Hartland, Mrs Kronberg, #Mr Leane, Mr Ondarchie, Ms Pennicuik, #Mrs Peulich, Mr Scheffer, #Mr Tarlamis, Mr Tee and Ms Tierney.

Legal and Social Issues Legislation Committee — Ms Crozier, Mr Elasmr, #Mr Elsbury, Ms Hartland, #Mr Leane, Ms Mikakos, Mrs Millar, Mr O'Brien, Mrs Peulich, #Mr Ramsay and Mr Viney.

Legal and Social Issues References Committee — Ms Crozier, Mr Elasmr, #Mr Elsbury, Ms Hartland, #Mr Leane, Ms Mikakos, Mrs Millar, Mr O'Brien, Mrs Peulich, #Mr Ramsay and Mr Viney.

Participating member

Joint committees

Accountability and Oversight Committee — (*Council*): Mr P. Davis, Mr O'Brien. (*Assembly*): Ms Kanis, Mr McIntosh and Ms Neville.

Dispute Resolution Committee — (*Council*): Mr D. Davis, Mr Hall, Mr Lenders, Ms Lovell and Ms Pennicuik. (*Assembly*): Ms Allan, Ms Asher, Mr Clark, Ms Hennessy, Mr Merlino, Mr O'Brien and Mr Walsh.

Economic Development, Infrastructure and Outer Suburban/Interface Services Committee — (*Council*): Mr Eideh and Mrs Peulich. (*Assembly*): Mr Burgess, Mrs Fyffe, Mr McGuire and Mr Shaw.

Education and Training Committee — (*Council*): Mr Elasmr, Mrs Kronberg and Mrs Millar. (*Assembly*): Mr Brooks and Mr Crisp.

Electoral Matters Committee — (*Council*): Mr Finn, Mrs Peulich, Mr Somyurek and Mr Tarlamis. (*Assembly*): Mr Northe.

Environment and Natural Resources Committee — (*Council*): Mr Koch. (*Assembly*): Mr Bull, Ms Duncan, Mr Pandazopoulos and Ms Wreford.

Family and Community Development Committee — (*Council*): Mrs Coote, Ms Crozier and Mr O'Brien. (*Assembly*): Ms Halfpenny, Mr McGuire and Mr Wakeling.

House Committee — (*Council*): The President (*ex officio*) Mr Drum, Mr Eideh, Mr Finn, Ms Hartland, and Mr P. Davis. (*Assembly*): The Speaker (*ex officio*), Ms Beattie, Ms Campbell, Mrs Fyffe, Ms Thomson, Mr Wakeling and Mr Weller.

Independent Broad-based Anti-corruption Commission Committee — (*Council*): Mr Viney. (*Assembly*): Ms Hennessy, Mr McIntosh, Mr Newton-Brown and Mr Weller.

Law Reform, Drugs and Crime Prevention Committee — (*Council*): Mr Ramsay and Mr Scheffer. (*Assembly*): Mr Carroll, Mr McCurdy and Mr Southwick.

Public Accounts and Estimates Committee — (*Council*): Mr O'Brien and Mr Ondarchie. (*Assembly*): Mr Angus, Ms Hennessey, Mr Morris, Mr Pakula and Mr Scott.

Road Safety Committee — (*Council*): Mr Elsbury. (*Assembly*): Mr Languiller, Mr Perera, Mr Tilley and Mr Thompson.

Rural and Regional Committee — (*Council*): Mr Drum. (*Assembly*): Mr Howard, Mr Katos, Mr Trezise and Mr Weller.

Scrutiny of Acts and Regulations Committee — (*Council*): Mr Dalla-Riva. (*Assembly*): Ms Barker, Ms Campbell, Mr Gidley, Mr Nardella, Dr Sykes and Mr Watt.

Heads of parliamentary departments

Assembly — Clerk of the Parliaments and Clerk of the Legislative Assembly: Mr R. W. Purdey

Council — Clerk of the Legislative Council: Mr W. R. Tunnecliffe

Parliamentary Services — Secretary: Mr P. Lochert

MEMBERS OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL
FIFTY-SEVENTH PARLIAMENT — FIRST SESSION

President: The Hon. B. N. ATKINSON

Deputy President: Mr M. VINEY

Acting Presidents: Ms Crozier, Mr Eideh, Mr Elasmr, Mr Finn, Mr O'Brien, Mr Ondarchie, Ms Pennicuik, Mr Ramsay, Mr Tarlamis

Leader of the Government:

The Hon. D. M. DAVIS

Deputy Leader of the Government:

The Hon. W. A. LOVELL

Leader of the Opposition:

Mr J. LENDERS

Deputy Leader of the Opposition:

Mr G. JENNINGS

Leader of The Nationals:

The Hon. P. R. HALL

Deputy Leader of The Nationals:

Mr D. DRUM

Member	Region	Party	Member	Region	Party
Atkinson, Hon. Bruce Norman	Eastern Metropolitan	LP	Lenders, Mr John	Southern Metropolitan	ALP
Barber, Mr Gregory John	Northern Metropolitan	Greens	Lovell, Hon. Wendy Ann	Northern Victoria	LP
Broad, Ms Candy Celeste	Northern Victoria	ALP	Melhem, Mr Cesar ²	Western Metropolitan	LP
Coote, Mrs Andrea	Southern Metropolitan	LP	Mikakos, Ms Jenny	Northern Metropolitan	ALP
Crozier, Ms Georgina Mary	Southern Metropolitan	LP	Millar, Mrs Amanda Louise ⁴	Northern Victoria	LP
Dalla-Riva, Hon. Richard Alex Gordon	Eastern Metropolitan	LP	O'Brien, Mr David Roland Joseph	Western Victoria	Nats
Darveniza, Ms Kaye Mary	Northern Victoria	ALP	O'Donohue, Mr Edward John	Eastern Victoria	LP
Davis, Hon. David McLean	Southern Metropolitan	LP	Ondarchie, Mr Craig Philip	Northern Metropolitan	LP
Davis, Mr Philip Rivers	Eastern Victoria	LP	Pakula, Hon. Martin Philip ¹	Western Metropolitan	ALP
Drum, Mr Damian Kevin	Northern Victoria	Nats	Pennicuik, Ms Susan Margaret	Southern Metropolitan	Greens
Eideh, Mr Khalil M.	Western Metropolitan	ALP	Petrovich, Mrs Donna-Lee ³	Northern Victoria	LP
Elasmr, Mr Nazih	Northern Metropolitan	ALP	Peulich, Mrs Inga	South Eastern Metropolitan	LP
Elsbury, Mr Andrew Warren	Western Metropolitan	LP	Pulford, Ms Jaala Lee	Western Victoria	ALP
Finn, Mr Bernard Thomas C.	Western Metropolitan	LP	Ramsay, Mr Simon	Western Victoria	LP
Guy, Hon. Matthew Jason	Northern Metropolitan	LP	Rich-Phillips, Hon. Gordon Kenneth	South Eastern Metropolitan	LP
Hall, Hon. Peter Ronald	Eastern Victoria	Nats	Scheffer, Mr Johan Emiel	Eastern Victoria	ALP
Hartland, Ms Colleen Mildred	Western Metropolitan	Greens	Somyurek, Mr Adem	South Eastern Metropolitan	ALP
Jennings, Mr Gavin Wayne	South Eastern Metropolitan	ALP	Tarlamis, Mr Lee Reginald	South Eastern Metropolitan	ALP
Koch, Mr David Frank	Western Victoria	LP	Tee, Mr Brian Lennox	Eastern Metropolitan	ALP
Kronberg, Mrs Janice Susan	Eastern Metropolitan	LP	Tierney, Ms Gayle Anne	Western Victoria	ALP
Leane, Mr Shaun Leo	Eastern Metropolitan	ALP	Viney, Mr Matthew Shaw	Eastern Victoria	ALP

¹ Resigned 26 March 2013

² Appointed 8 May 2013

³ Resigned 1 July 2013

⁴ Appointed 21 August 2013

CONTENTS

QUESTIONS ON NOTICE

THURSDAY, 19 SEPTEMBER 2013

9456.	<i>Health: budget expenditure.....</i>	3031
9503.	<i>Health: Wallan ambulance services.....</i>	3031
9505.	<i>Health: solarium ban.....</i>	3032
9513.	<i>Health: dental services.....</i>	3032
9514.	<i>Health: outdoor smoking bans</i>	3033
9559.	<i>Health: Mercy Hospital for Women midwifery care</i>	3033

QUESTIONS ON NOTICE

*Answers to the following questions on notice were circulated on the date shown.
Questions have been incorporated from the notice paper of the Legislative Council.
Answers have been incorporated in the form supplied by the departments on behalf of the appropriate ministers.
The portfolio of the minister answering the question on notice starts each heading.*

Thursday, 19 September 2013

Health: budget expenditure

- 9456. MS HARTLAND** — To ask the Minister for Health: In regard to budget spending in the previous two budget cycles (2011–12 and 2012–13), excluding finances provided by the commonwealth government:
- (1) how much was achieved in savings from total Victorian government budget expenditure on health in each financial year compared to the 2010–11 financial year;
 - (2) if Victorian government expenditure was redirected within the health budget, how much was redirected in each financial year;
 - (3) if Victorian government expenditure was redirected within the health budget, from where was it reduced and where was it increased, and how much in each case in each financial year.

I am informed that:

- (1) The 2011–12 state budget papers (budget paper no. 3 page 112) shows savings in 2011–12 of \$115.3 million.

The 2012–13 state budget papers (budget paper no. 3 page 23) shows savings in 2012–13 of \$32.3 million. These savings are directed cut back of house services and departmental savings with front-line services protected.

Savings as you will see from the budget also contain a focus on smarter and bulk purchasing through Health Purchasing Victoria.

The coalition has increased spending to the health portfolio by \$1.3 billion over the last two years.

Savings were not disclosed in the 2010–11 state budget papers.

Although, you will note my answer to a question without notice on 2 May 2012, listing Labor’s savings which exceeded \$1 billion.

- (2) There were no significant budget redirections.
- (3) Not applicable.

Labor cut more than \$1 billion through savings over a six-year period.

Health: Wallan ambulance services

- 9503. MS HARTLAND** — To ask the Minister for Health: In relation to the proposed 24-hour ambulance station at the growing town of Wallan in north-east Victoria, which in June 2010 the Liberal-National Coalition announced that, if elected, it would build and have operational by the end of its first term of government:

- (1) Has a site been selected for the new station.
- (2) When do you expect the site to be purchased.
- (3) When will the construction of the station commence.
- (4) When will the station be operational.

- (5) When will the government provide funding for this project.
- (6) What impact has the ongoing 12-minute drive of ambulances from Kilmore to Wallan had on paramedic response times.
- (7) What impact has the 12-minute drive for ambulances from Kilmore to Wallan had on survival rates for those suffering cardiac arrest.

I am informed that:

- (1) A site has been selected for the new station.
- (2) Ambulance Victoria and the Government Land Monitor are progressing with the acquisition of the selected site.
- (3) I am advised that construction is anticipated to commence April 2014.
- (4) I am advised that the anticipated completion date is October 2014.
- (5) Funding for the project is already provided as part of the Victorian government's \$151 million investment in ambulance services.
- (6) The location of the Wallan team in Kilmore has had a positive impact in Wallan. Since commencement code 1 response times in Wallan have improved from an average of 19.1 minutes to 17.7 minutes.
- (7) For the three-year period between 2009–10 and 2011–12 there were no cases in Wallan which met the criteria for inclusion in the cardiac arrest survival indicator.

Health: solarium ban

9505. MS HARTLAND — To ask the Minister for Health: In relation to the government's commitment, announced in November 2012, that it intends to ban solariums at the end of 2014:

- (1) When will the government introduce the bill with this reform into Parliament.
- (2) Will the bill include measures to limit the sale of second-hand beds to private parties, and, if so, what are these measures.

I am informed that:

- (1) The government has announced its intention to ban commercial tanning units from the end of 2014. All licence-holders authorised under the Radiation Act 2005 to operate solariums have been advised in writing of that decision and the draft legislation to give effect to that commitment is currently in development.
- (2) The government has not announced a ban on private tanning units or a ban on the sale of second-hand beds to private parties. I have begun a process with the Standing Council on Health to investigate the potential options for a nationally consistent ban on commercially operated tanning units and a ban on the importation and manufacture of tanning units.

Health: dental services

9513. MS HARTLAND — To ask the Minister for Health: On what date did Victoria sign onto the National Partnership Agreement for adult public dental services.

I am informed that:

The Honourable Dr Denis Napthine, MP, Premier of Victoria, signed the National Partnership Agreement on Treating More Dental Patients (NPA) on 7 May 2013.

Health: outdoor smoking bans

9514. MS HARTLAND — To ask the Minister for Health: In relation to the consultation on smoke-free children's playgrounds and related recreational areas which closed on 17 May 2013:

- (1) Will the submissions, particularly by organisations, be made public.
- (2) Will the report on the findings of the consultation be made public.
- (3) When will the government response to the consultation findings be made public.

I am informed that:

The Department of Health (the department) public consultation drew a total of 7824 responses, comprising 599 responses to the community survey from sporting organisations and clubs, public health organisations, local government and parent-family organisations, and 7225 submissions by email via the no.smoking@health.vic.gov.au email address. Many of these submissions came via the Keep Fresh Air Fresh campaign which calls for the introduction of a ban on smoking in outdoor dining areas.

In addition, of the 79 councils, 73 responded in full and 3 with partial responses.

The department is now analysing the submissions. Results will be reported to me and will inform the final scope and implementation of the proposed outdoor smoking bans. Once completed, the department will assess the feasibility of making submissions public.

Health: Mercy Hospital for Women midwifery care

9559. MS HARTLAND — To ask the Minister for Health: In respect to the planned closure of the Family Birth Centre and replacement with a caseload model of care at the Mercy Hospital for Women in Heidelberg:

- (1) What is the reasoning behind replacing the Family Birth Centre model of care with a caseload model of care.
- (2) Is there any evidence in respect to the birth outcomes to warrant closure of the Family Birth Centre.
- (3) How does the record of birth outcomes at the Family Birth Centre compare to outcomes in other low-risk models of care in respect to intervention rates and survival of mother and baby for the 2009–10, 2010–11, and 2011–2012 financial years.
- (4) What is the economic case for the caseload model of care over the Family Birth Centre model of care.
- (5) Is a trial planned for the caseload model before it begins full operation.
- (6) Is it possible to trial the caseload model of care while retaining the Family Birth Centre.
- (7) Which hospitals in Victoria offer the caseload model of maternity care.
- (8) If the Family Birth Centre closes, what options will women have who want a midwife-led, active birthing experience, without intervention from an obstetrician.
- (9) Will the government intervene to stop the closure of the Family Birth Centre.

I am informed that:

- (1) Mercy Hospital for Women has advised that the decision to implement a midwifery group practice model of care is based on the outcomes of a comprehensive review of their maternity services, including the views and experiences of women.

The midwifery group practice model of care will build upon the principles of the family birth centre to provide low levels of intervention during labour and birth within a home-like environment. Additionally, women will have improved access to medical care, if required, whilst remaining under the care of their primary midwife.

- (2) The review undertaken by Mercy Hospital for Women showed support for midwife-led models of care that promote continuity of care and carer regardless of whether medical care is required.

Data collected by Mercy Hospital for Women indicates that a third to half of women are transferred from the family birth centre to other areas of the hospital for medical care during labour and birth. The midwifery group practice model of care will enable women to receive medical care, if required, whilst remaining under the care of their primary midwife.

The new model of care will operate out of the existing family birth centre.

- (3) As stated above, data indicates that a third to half of all women are transferred from the family birth centre to other areas of the hospital for medical care during labour and birth. The midwifery group practice model of care will enable women to receive medical care, if required, whilst remaining under the care of their primary midwife.

A recent review at the Royal Women's Hospital found that caseload midwifery care for women experiencing a low-risk pregnancy resulted in better outcomes including a reduced rate of intervention during labour and birth (e.g. epidural pain relief, episiotomy, caesarean section), and reduced length of hospital stay when compared with standard public hospital maternity care.

- (4) Mercy Hospital for Women advises that the cost of operating the family birth centre and a midwifery group practice model of care are similar. The decision to implement a midwifery group practice model of care is based on the improved quality outcomes and greater access for women to a midwife-led model of care.
- (5) Midwifery-led models of care have been successfully introduced at a number of public health services across Victoria and in light of this, Mercy Hospital for Women has advised that they will not trial the midwifery group practice model of care.
- (6) Mercy Hospital for Women has advised that resources (e.g. infrastructure, staffing) will be allocated to implementing the midwifery group practice model.
- (7) Midwifery-led models of care have been implemented at a number of public health services across Victoria including the Royal Women's Hospital, Sunshine Hospital, Angliss Hospital and Barwon Health.
- (8) The midwifery group practice model will offer women a one-to-one midwife-led model of care. The new model will build upon the principles of the family birth centre to provide low levels of intervention during labour and birth within a home-like environment and enable more women to access one-to-one midwifery-led care than the current family birth centre model.
- (9) The decision to implement a particular model of care is the responsibility of individual health services. In this context, health services have autonomy and flexibility to enable them to be innovative and responsive to local needs. The decision to implement a midwifery group practice model of care at Mercy Hospital for Women has been based on the outcomes of a comprehensive review of their maternity services, including the views and experiences of women.