

The Kodály Music Education Institute of Australia

Incorporated
Registered No. Y2630238
ABN 26 678 344 033



Tess Laird
National President
Kodaly Music Education Institute of Australia, Inc
2 Qantas Crt,
Toowoomba, QLD, 4350



10th February, 2013

The Chair: David Southwick MP
Education and Training Committee
Inquiry into the extent, benefits and potential of music education in Victorian Schools

Dear Mr Southwick,

Thank you for the invitation to provide a submission towards the Parliament of Victoria Inquiry into the extent, benefits and potential of music education in Victorian Schools.

I am happy to respond on behalf of the Kodaly Music Education Institute of Australia, Inc. We represent around 700 active members, including Early Childhood, Primary, Secondary, Tertiary, Choral and Instrumental music educators, and a sizable number of members are associated with our very active and well respected Victorian Branch.

The following response given is given in good faith that the information accurately reflects fact or the general opinion of our members at this time. I would particularly like to acknowledge the work of Jason Goopy and Deborah Smith in summarising much of the research currently available. The work of Dr Anna Lierse is quoted in detail.

We look forward to hearing of your committee's findings with regard to this matter, and trust that the Parliament of Victoria will work to embrace your recommendations with a view to providing the best music education possible for students in their state.

Yours sincerely,



Tess Laird
National President
KMEIA, Inc

www.kodaly.org.au

The National affiliated body of the International Kodály Society

EVIDENCE SUPPORTING MUSIC EDUCATION IN SCHOOLS

1. Benefits to society and to individual students wanting to pursue music as a career

Firstly, the benefits to society are multiple:

- Musical expression is a positive outlet for all emotions, and is a vehicle for self expression
- Rehearsing and performing with various choral and instrumental groups allows individuals to develop and foster social links which are not restricted to electronic media, and which can promote personal contact and interaction with others
- Musical performances are a positive way for musicians and audience to join and meet in large numbers, and to experience, appreciate and celebrate artistic achievements which require equal validation alongside sporting and other academic areas in our society.
- Links to and within many communities are strengthened and made more meaningful by musical performances:

ie. Performances for aged care residents, cultural events, school events, religious services, military and other significant nationalistic services, social events such as weddings, birthdays and funerals, important presentations, functions and openings, etc

Secondly, the benefits to the individual pursuing a musical career are in most cases, immeasurable:

- Many musicians would have initially begun their music education through their school experience.
- Parents may choose to subsidise musical studies on the advice and encouragement of school personnel involved in music education.
- Aptitude for musical expression and understanding can be developed from the very youngest ages, and therefore must be fostered from the earliest stages of education – child care, kindergarten, preschool and preparatory years, primary schooling and right through to secondary schooling.
- Students wishing to pursue music as a career need the enrichment that school environments can provide through whole class music lessons, access to individual and small group tuition, choral and instrumental ensembles, musical theatre productions, concerts, assemblies, competitions, ceremonies and social events.
- Tertiary institutions are very interested to note a wealth of student experiences and achievements with regard to school background when auditioning and interviewing candidates for study.
- All musicians would attest to the value of school musical experiences, and how they helped to shape their potential and their performance abilities.
- Leadership qualities must first be taught through example, and many musical directors and music teachers would also attest that their greatest role models were teachers at school who inspired, encouraged and mentored their progress.

2. General benefits to students as a result of music education

Students in a good music education programme at school will gain many general benefits distinct from the development of their musical potential:

- Classroom music lessons offer an opportunity for students to develop many social skills.
- From the earliest years, musical games provide the structure of developing an adherence to rules (the procedure of the game), social justice (taking turns, working in circles, accepting everyone's contribution), a healthy and acceptable model for physical interaction with other students, respect and tolerance for the art of other cultures as well as their own.
- Encouraging the confidence to perform alone and to critically self-evaluate those performances with a view to how to improve future performances.
- Providing opportunities to work within groups, to lead groups in order to produce artistic works, and to appreciate the work of others.
- Most good music programmes which are viable in schools with the least amount of funding and with a view to equitable access for all are based on an *aural/vocal approach*. Singing has been found to be good for your health because it not only increases heart rate, but also improves breathing, lung capacity, posture and mood. Certain studies have even recorded an increase in immune system functioning because of the increase in oxygenated blood flow and release of endorphins as a result of singing for extended periods of time.
- Singing connects us to a different part of our brain which gives us pleasure. Singing together in a group is an even better way of improving wellbeing. A 2011 Research project, conducted by the Wellness Promotion Unit at Victoria University, and funded by VicHealth, examined group singing and its associated health and wellbeing benefits. This study was co authored by Professor Jenny Sharples, psychologist and Executive Dean at Victoria University.
- Because of the controlled breathing required, singing promotes immediate benefits for those with asthma. Recent statistics suggest that asthma affects around 1 in 8 children and 1 in 10 adults.
- Singing counteracts stress, because it manages breathing, which helps with anxiety and panic. Students are reporting an increase in the amount of stress associated with succeeding in other subject areas and demands of national testing.
- Further benefits were found to be increased feelings of self-confidence, empowerment, and interpersonal skills, along with lowered feelings of isolation, depression and anxiety.
- A classic example of the extra musical benefits of music education and involvement in group singing is the "Choir of Hard Knocks" made up of homeless people. From a schools perspective, I and many others can personally attest to the power of the music program in providing an outlet and a place of inclusion for many students who don't "fit in" to the other social groups within the school community. The music room is often the only "safe environment" for these individuals.

3. Benefits to student academic performance as a result of music education

Various research exists to suggest that music education programs founded on *aural/vocal pedagogy* in a *sequential developmental approach* offer many benefits to academic performance, via the development of thinking and listening skills, literacy and numeracy skills, spatial-temporal reasoning, intelligence and social emotional development.

- Friss (1966) found that comprehension, reading, writing, memorisation, arithmetic, speech fluency, aesthetic awareness, fine motor skills, reasoning facility, and behaviour were more disciplined in students attending the Hungarian Music Primary schools as opposed to students in ordinary schools.
- Kokas (1969) carried out tests which showed remarkable differences in rhythm, sound observation, gymnastics, and arithmetic abilities of school children at the Primary Music Schools in Hungary. Also, somatic tests made by anthropologists reported high values in chest expansion and the vital capacity of the musical groups.
- Laczó (1985) investigated the interrelation of intelligence and Kodály-based music education using Raven's Progressive Matrices (RPM). The results indicated that students in the music classes scored higher on the intelligence test than others.
- In 1972, Deanna Hoermann established the Developmental Music Program based on Kodály's philosophy in the Metropolitan West Region of the New South Wales Department of Education, Australia. The program was adapted for Australian curriculum, teachers and schools. Bridges (1980) presented results which compared the education achievements of Year 6 children from three schools which had used a Kodály based music program with a sample of children from three other schools where music was not taught developmentally, matched for size and socioeconomic status. Analysis showed a significant superiority of the music group over the control group across the board, particularly in reading and mathematical concepts. The author states that many observations could not be quantified.

"Visitors to classes in the project have seen for themselves the unselfconscious involvement of children in a total education experience and have noted their performance skills, both singing and playing, their aural awareness, their spontaneity, their ability to carry out relatively complex musical tasks, their peer group relationships, social interaction, personal adequacy, and classroom behaviour." Bridges (1980, p. 106)

- Gromko (2005) tested the hypothesis that music instruction that emphasised the development of aural perception would lead to significant gains in the development of young children's phonemic awareness, which is an important and reliable predictor of later reading ability. Results revealed that kindergarten children who received four months of music education showed significantly greater gains in development of their phoneme-segmentation fluency when compared with children who did not receive music education.
- Gardiner, Fox, Knowles and Jeffrey published the correlation of arts education research including Kodály-based music education and educational achievement in *Nature* (1996) and in complete form several years later (Gardiner, 2000). Half of the first grade classes in two elementary schools received the district's standard arts curriculum approximately one hour per week, while the other half of first grade classes received two hours weekly of a "test arts" program. The "test arts" program consisted of visual arts and special emphasis on the development of musical skill through the use of Kodály-based music instruction with classroom teacher involvement. Academic progress

of the students was assessed by standardised tests. Though starting significantly behind the control group, by the end of first grade the test arts students had caught up to their control peers in reading.

- The study by Gardiner et al. (1996) also documents that students in the “test arts” program significantly surpassed the control group in mathematical achievement by the end of the first grade. Those students receiving two years of the “test arts” had the highest performance in math, those with one year either in first or second grade had the next highest and those with no “test arts” had the lowest math performance.
- Gardiner (2000) also found positive parallels between learning to singing in-tune, and mathematical development, and that learning to sing on pitch can improve self-esteem.
- Gardiner (2000) noted interestingly, that the gains from the Kodály-based music program in reading were found to parallel improvements in classroom attitudes and behaviours as assessed by Lickert scale questionnaires given to classroom teachers.
- In an Australian study that correlated Kodály-based music education and math skills, Geoghegan and Mitchelmore (1996) found that a pre-school Kodály-based music program possibly had effects on mathematical achievement. 35 preschool children involved in the treatment music program were compared at school entry to 39 preschool children without musical experience. All children were from families with similar socioeconomic backgrounds. Analysis of tests revealed that students with music instruction had significantly higher mean scores on the *Test of Early Mathematics Ability -2 (TEAM-2)*.
- Schellenberg (2004) undertook a study that randomly assigned a large sample of children to four different groups for a year, one receiving Kodály-based lessons (voice) and one receiving keyboard lessons. The two control groups either received instruction in a non-musical artistic activity (drama) or no lessons. The use of two music groups made it possible to assess the generality of possible effects of music instruction, and whether non-musical aspects of Kodály instruction accounted for the effect reported by Gardiner et al. (1996). All four groups exhibited increases in IQ as would be expected over the time period but the music groups had reliably larger increases in full scale IQ.
- Levitin (2006) describes music as engaging higher level processing skills. For instance, as we listen to music, we recall what has already been heard, remember what will come next if we know the music, or predict what will come next if the genre is familiar but not the piece, and we respond to additional information such as performers’ movements or summaries we’ve read or heard in advance.
- Levitin (2006) also comments on the artistic qualities which allow music to move us , and therefore be considered one of the pinnacles of mankind’s contribution to society. Although music is organised sound, it is the element of the unexpected which allows the composer and performers to manipulate the listener’s emotions.

CURRENT PROVISION OF MUSIC EDUCATION in VICTORIA

4. Music education provided through specific funding for music education

At present, the general opinion of music teachers is that the provision of music education in schools is greatly varied. In some schools it is highly valued and in others it does not exist. *Having an effective music curriculum depends on the Principals.* Where teacher training is inadequate the quality can be very low. The majority of schools see music lessons purely as release time for class teachers.

The Current funding arrangement for music education in Victorian Schools is severely limited. It is up to the individual school to decide what funding is available. The amount of funding provided by the Government is inadequate. Moneys provided are not specifically designated purely for music education, and state schools have a tendency to include music within a Performing Arts subject, even though music is more effectively taught and understood as a discrete subject area in its own right.

The following is quoted directly from Dr Lierse (Text in blue)

The acknowledged best model for Music Education includes a combination of classroom teaching, instrumental and vocal music tuition, input from professional musicians, and partnerships between community and professional.

The national figure for the provision of class music in government schools is a low 23% compared with 88% in independent schools.

Instrumental music in Independent schools

A large number of Independent schools offer an excellent co-curricular instrumental music program with students attending lessons in class time and attending ensembles before or after schools. This is essentially a fee for service elective and is a big industry in many schools. Instrumental staff are employed in a number of ways, e.g. as a member of staff on a salary, or by day or hour. These teachers receive payment from the school according to the number of students they are teaching, or the student may pay the teacher directly. There are also many schools that have instrumental tuition as part of the classroom music program where all students at certain year levels (e.g. grade 3 or 4) experience a term or so on a string, woodwind or brass instrument. It is designed to assist students select an instrument and move onto formal lessons.

Instrumental music in government primary schools

Many government primary schools are also engaging instrumental teachers as a user pays service. There is an issue with the quality of many of the instrumental teachers employed in government primary schools many of which have low-level instrumental skills and no teacher training. These programs are often run by franchises such as 'Creative Music', which employ young people with low-level skills at very low wages. On the other hand there are some outstanding instrumental teachers who are running excellent programs in primary, some of whom were top international performers and, due to the re-classification of the role of instrumental teachers as tutor or coach by the Victorian Institute of Teachers, are drawing the same low wage in order to get work. These HR employment decisions are often made at a local level by principals. Without any musical expertise, the principals are in no position to understand the full ramifications of these decisions.

Instrumental music provision in Victorian government secondary schools

Music is a performing art form so performing is paramount to a music education program. As music is essentially a performing art, the engagement of music specialist teachers to teach particular instruments and direct and conduct ensembles and choirs is highly desirable. Music performance is also an essential element of senior secondary music and VCE music courses.

The Victorian Regional Instrumental Music Program

This service, which provides instrumental teachers to government schools at no cost to the students, is the life-line to the effectiveness of music programs in many schools, and an investment in the future and quality of music performance groups in secondary schools. Instrumental music teachers employed by the Department are allocated to a Region, and travel from school to school to provide specialist tuition on a particular instrument and direct and conduct musical ensembles.

Many music programs are flourishing due to the services of these itinerate teachers. Students lucky enough to attend a government school that has the services of instrumental teachers can achieve high levels of performing expertise and take music to VCE level. Many also choose music courses at tertiary level and become some of Australia's top performers (*and*) international stars. A large number choose to become music teachers and work in our government and independent schools. The instrumental service is highly regarded by schools, parents and the students, but unfortunately (*this*) service does not nearly meet the needs in schools. Most students miss out and this is a contentious issue with Principals who have limited or no instrumental music allocation from their Region.

Many of the Principals without the services of the Regional instrumental teachers, or, wish to augment these, are employing their own teachers so they can offer their students the option of learning (*an*) instrument and performing in an ensemble. There are a number of ways they are financing the program including user pays, fundraising, and sharing the costs between the parents and the school budget.

VCE music performance is also supported by the VCAA who organise a showcase performance for top performers in their 'Top Class' and 'Top Acts' concerts. Other showcase concerts funded by the government include the 'Music Spectacular', and the controversial 'Rock Eisteddfod'.

5. Music education provided through non-specific funding , for example, general student resource package funding

Classroom music provision

Presently in Victoria there is a gross inequity in the percentage of schools that offer a continuous, sequential and developmental music education (as recommended by the National Review of Music Education (2005)). Research suggests that 80 per cent of independent schools have such programs compared to 23 per cent of government schools. It is believed that catholic schools are on a par with government schools.

Primary level classroom music provision

Unlike Queensland and Tasmania where Music is a mandatory subject in the curriculum and is taught by music specialist teachers, in Victorian government primary schools, the appointment of a music specialist classroom teacher is in response to the needs of the particular school's music program and is determined by the school itself and the principal. The cost of the music specialist is deducted from the school's global budget and therefore the service is free to students.

In medium and small primary schools, Principals report that the size of the global budget makes it difficult for the school to afford more than one or two specialist teachers, and choices must be made between appointing a visual arts, P.E or music specialist teacher.

If there is no provision for a music specialist to teach music at government primary schools, the classroom teachers are nominally responsible for implementing the music curriculum if the school chooses Music as one their art forms. A serious problem effecting the provision and quality of music in primary schools is the reliance on the generalist teacher to also teach music. This has proven to be ineffective in the majority of classrooms due to their inadequate training in music. The reality is that with most courses of primary teacher education providing minimal training in music, primary teacher education graduates over past decades have been ill-equipped both in competence and confidence to implement a sequential, developmental and continuous music education for primary school students.

Victorian regional and country schools are seriously marginalized when it comes to music education. Recent statistics on music education provision in primary schools in country Victoria (Heinrich, 2012) suggest that the provision and quality of music education continues to decline. The statistics show that a large percentage of primary schools in rural areas do not have music at all, principally government schools, (*and*) those that do have a token program.

Secondary level classroom music

Teachers who have music degrees plus education qualifications are employed in secondary schools and music is one of the Arts subjects schools can offer. Unlike NSW in years 7 & 8 music is not a compulsory subject in Victoria. In 1996, 11 per cent of Metropolitan and 19 per cent of Country schools did not have a music classroom program. This figure rose in years 9 & 10 where 30 per cent of schools with music programs did not offer music after years 7 & 8. There is some evidence that these figures are now even higher (see Research Reports below).

6. Music education provided through parent contribution

There are possibly three main ways parents contribute to music education in schools:

- Paying for the services of instrumental lessons
- Playing an active part in the school's music support groups such as 'Friends of Music' association of similar. Contributions include fundraising for instruments etc, assisting with the organization of concerts, musicals, excursions, transport, and camps.
- Parents who are musically trained actively teaching music to students at the school or assisting as accompanist, conductor, music management.

7. The extent and quality of music education provision in Victorian schools

The following significant Reports offer a clearer understanding of the present issues with classroom and instrumental music in Victorian Schools.

Research into the provision and quality of music education in Victoria

1. Bartle. G (1968). *Music in Australian Schools*
2. Ray. M, (1990). Report of Music Education Committee of Review.
3. Lierse. R. A. (1999) The Effectiveness of music programs in Government secondary schools 1995/6. Doctoral Thesis: Monash University
4. VASSP (1997). Music education in Victorian government secondary schools
5. Stevens. R, (2003). Trends in school music education provision in Australia
6. Pascoe, R Leong, S., et al. (2005) National Review of Music Education
7. Victorian Music Workshop (2007) School Music Action Group
8. Heinrich, J. (2011). The provision of music programs in country Victoria primary schools
9. Bridging the gap in school achievement through the Arts. The Song Room
10. The Status of Music Education: Submission to the Senate Inquiry into the Academic Standards of School Education. Australian Music Association.

1. Bartle. G (1968). *Music in Australian Schools*. Graham Bartle surveyed the results of school visits throughout Australia and reported:

- Music in school should be mainstreamed as most children miss out
- There needs to be more time allocated to music
- All children should have the opportunity to learn an instrument
- The quality of teaching is uneven and many children lose interest. We need a full-time music teacher in every primary and secondary school with the addition of specialist itinerant teachers
- Music should be for everyone in the school rather than a select few
- Lectures in teacher training institutions found that the majority (75%) of students entering teacher-training courses had no knowledge or background of music education from secondary schools. This resulted in the poor state of music in primary schools.

Although most of the recommendations from this report are repeated in all subsequent reports, the 1970s did see a gradual rise in instrumental music programs in schools. The music service was then faced with the need to engage specialist instrumental teachers to teach the more advanced instrumental students. Consequently, five music specialist schools and the Victorian College of the Arts Secondary School were formed and staffed with instrumental teachers to cover the range of band and orchestral instrument, and voice. Following a continuous expansion of the instrumental music services into schools in the 80s was a development of instrumental ensembles. The school band, choir and orchestra significantly enhanced the image of the schools which managed to procure the services of additional instrumental teachers. A major development of instrumental music in 1981 was the introduction of an instrumental music subject in the Higher School Certificate (HSC). This subject was designed both for students wishing to continue music at university and for students who were completing formal secondary education.

Meanwhile there developed growing competition between schools to have the services of itinerant music teachers so they could improve their music programs and develop ensemble programs. Now began an era of 'political' competition between schools to grab 'more for my school' from the limited cake available. In 1989 an Education Committee of Review under Margaret Ray was set up

to measure music provision in Victorian Government secondary schools and to get rid of the Instrumental Music Teacher (IMT) problem.

2. Ray, M, (1990). Report of Music Education Committee of Review. This major and comprehensive Review of the provision and quality of music programs in Victorian Government schools showed that the limited supply of instrumental music teachers created new challenges for music education in schools. Data collected showed that there were 267.5 full-time equivalent instrumental positions for teachers with 16,900 students reaching only 8 percent of the enrolment in a limited number of schools. Classroom music was also found to be limited and quality variable with only 25 percent of all post primary students receiving classroom music in a given week. Recommendations from the Review included the increase in the number of instrumental teachers employed by the department, and the movement of their administration to the Regions.

3. Lierse, R. A. (1999) The Effectiveness of music programs in Government secondary schools 2005-6' Doctoral Thesis, Monash University.

During the 1990s, the change in government initiated dramatic changes to the management of schools with the introduction of 'Schools of the Future' along with new curriculum priorities. It also implemented a cut of 20 percent to the teaching force. Anecdotal evidence showing the gains made in music education in the 1980s were seriously at risk prompted the above study.

Following a survey of every Victorian government secondary school, findings revealed that the move to self-managing schools had a devastating effect on music programs with 50 percent of schools reporting that they had or were about to reduce or close their music program. New government curriculum priorities, such as the mandated 100 minutes each of sport and PE, compulsory languages and technology, put pressure on the overcrowded curriculum and schools found that some subjects had to go to make room for the new priorities. The cuts to the teaching force in each school put pressure on schools to reduce their programs. Music, arts and humanities were reduced. Music lost its identity and became one of the Arts in the P -10 frameworks and subsequent documents. Regional music support centres were closed and Universities reduced their pre-service primary music education component, some to as little as 10 hours (now an average of 17).

Provision of classroom music programs in government schools.

- The provision of generalist music programs in the majority of schools was found to be patchy lacking sequence and breadth, and was predominately tokenistic
- In 2006 88% of the 316 State Secondary Schools had a classroom music program. Some programs were in the process of closing.
- Breakdown of secondary schools without a program: Metropolitan, 11%, Country 19%
- 30% of schools with music programs did not offer music at years 9 & 10
- Of the 39% of the schools that offered VCE music, 75% had 5 or less students enrolled.
- 30% of schools did not employ a music teacher full-time. 25% of schools employed a teacher for 0.6 (3 days a week) or less, 14% employed a music teacher for 0.2 - 0.4 (one or two days a week).

Provision of the instrumental music program

The provision of instrumental music teachers (IMTs) to Victorian Government Secondary schools was found to be one of the most highly valued educational resources that the State provides to schools. This program was provided to students at no cost to students with instrumental staff

provided to schools from a pool of instrumental teachers allocated to schools and administered by the regional instrumental coordinator(s). Provision was regrettably limited and its provision had never been considered close to meeting the needs of schools and students.

- 17% of schools had no instrumental music provision. Of the schools with an allocation of instrumental teacher(s) most had a limited program.
- The total time allocated to each school was found to vary from 0.1 to 6.6 (one designated music school). 23% of schools had an allowance of 2.0 or less with only 7 schools exceeding this. The remaining schools had less than 0.5 instrumental allocation.
- While most programs were small and tokenistic (e.g. a guitar teacher for two hours a week), 42% had a moderately effective program offering music classes to students in 3 or more or more of the six Year levels. Some offered ensembles such as bands, choirs and in a few cases a string program. 7% (15 schools) had a highly effective program. These schools offered classes from year 7 -12 (including VCE music), and had a number of ensembles to accommodate the various levels of the students development. These schools included the designated music schools which had a more generous allocation of instrumental teachers, and were able to offer auditioned students a place regardless of where they lived.

4. VASSP (1997). Music education in Victorian government secondary schools.

The issue of the inequitable provision of the instrumental services to schools resulted in the Victorian Association of State School Principals forming a working party to investigate the ongoing issues with instrumental music. The Committee (in 1989) confronted the challenge of ‘getting rid of the IMT problem’ by simply distributing the IMT resources according to the principle of ‘Equity’. There was a call to cancel the IM staffing allocation and give an equal staff allocation to each secondary school). After studying all aspects of the issues, the 1997 committee was again formed and adopted the following definition of equity and subsequently developed a new funding model to preserve the program.

“It is the firm belief of the committee that equity in the case of music and instrumental music, does NOT mean spreading current resources thinly across the program which currently exists and WOULD NOT BE EQUITABLE. Such an allocation would NOT enable schools to run effective instrumental programs because IMT qualifications usually are limited to one or two areas of expertise, eg. woodwind, brass. Similarly, to fund all schools equally in terms of instrumental music would effectively destroy the IM program. Funds may be allocated by schools for other areas which they see as having a significantly greater priority, or because of factors which limit the opportunities to run effective programs, and that it should be funded accordingly” (see list below Section 5) p. 32- 35.

They concluded that **“they (the Vic Govt.) not only keep the current music/IM Program intact, but actually (work) to build on it.”**

5. Stevens, R. (2003). Trends in school music education provision in Australia

A National Mapping of the provision of music education in schools by the Music Council of Australia found that in Victoria there was a wide disparity of the provision of music education in Independent school (approximately 88%) and Government schools (approximately 23%). Victoria was found to be the second lowest provider of VCE/HSC music in the country. In addition it was one of the only states where classroom music was not mandated either at Primary or Secondary level. The provision of music in Victorian schools was found to be reliant on the determination of the school principal, usually based on gaining access to a specialist teacher.

Stevens found the collection of statistical data had limitations due to un-cooperative State Education Departments, a lack of data on music collected by the States, and confusion surrounding what music 'provision' actually was. More research was needed to measure the true state of music education in each state. The National Review into Music Education was an outcome of this research.

6. Pascoe, R Leong, S., et al. (2005) National Review of Music Education (NRSME).

Music Education in Australia is in a state of crisis

In 2004 the Music Council of Australia, the Australian Society for Music Education, the Australian Music Association and a number of individuals took on the task of persuading the Federal Government to conduct an inquiry into the state of music education in Australian Schools. The final report was delivered to Minister Nelson in Nov.2005. Some startling critical findings included:

- Many Australian students miss out on effective music education because of the lack of equity of access, lack of quality provision; and the poor status of music in many schools.
- Music education in Australian schools is at a critical point where prompt action is needed to right the inequalities in school music.
- Music – specific professional development is urgently required for generalist classroom (primary) teachers currently in schools.
- Hours for pre-service teacher education for music have contracted radically in the last ten years and do not adequately prepare generalist primary teachers for teaching music in schools. Urgent action is needed to address this problem. (pp. v-vi)

The review took a close look at the serious disparity between public schools in general and some well-endowed independent schools that had programs rich in resources and equipment and found alarming differences. Examples of best practice demonstrated how beneficial music education is to the child, benefits which are supported by a large body of research. The need for music programs to be continuous, sequential, and developmental was strongly argued.

Apart from a few minor responses to the Recommendations of the Review from the Howard Federal Government before it changed office, and despite the recommendation from a National Workshop along with continuous pressure to the Government to implement the Recommendations from the review, Australia is still waiting for action.

7. Victorian Music Workshop (2007) School Music Action Group

The Victorian Music Workshop held in April 2007 experienced unprecedented support from over one hundred delegates representing all areas of state, catholic and independent schools, tertiary institutions, professional music companies, community music providers, parent organizations and the music industry. Their concern for the state of music education in Victorian was clearly articulated. The Victorian community had also supported the National Review of School Music Education (NRSME) when they sent 1,419 submissions. At the conclusion of the Workshop the School Music Action Group was formed.

The Workshop undertook an examination of the recommendations from the NRSME (DEEWR), and the action points from the National Music Workshop report (Australian Music Association) March 2007), and considered them within the Victorian context.

The Review concluded that Music Education in the State of Victoria had all the shortcomings articulated in the National Review and set about to develop a Report where strategies were set out to redress these deficiencies taking into account the uniquely Victorian circumstances, policies and educational structures. The Report acknowledges the important role that the Victorian Government can play in addressing the deficiencies of Music Education in Victorian schools along with a

collective effort from the music sector including teachers, schools, universities, community groups, and the music industry.

At the conclusion of the Victorian Workshop, the School Music Action Group was formed.

8. Heinrich, J. (2011). The provision of music programs in country Victorian primary schools. This research is of considerable importance, as like the Research into the Effectiveness of Music Programs in Victorian government secondary schools in 1995/6, it provides quantitative and qualitative data from a whole area of school provision. What is now needed is data from the Catholic and independent schools, and even more importantly metropolitan primary schools in the Government system.

Heinrich's research showed that more than a third (38%) of rural Victorian primary schools do not offer classroom music programs. Overwhelmingly, the two most common reasons for not running a program were insufficient budgets and lack of availability of appropriate staff. Almost 40% of principals said that they had experienced difficulty in finding a music teacher to fill a position either at their current school or at another in the past.

If there are insufficient qualified teachers to meet demand, as revealed by principals in this research, then it follows that attention must be given to the origin of music teachers – universities, particularly in this case, regional universities. If we are to have adequate numbers of music teachers in the country, then we *must* educate them here.

9. Bridging the gap in school achievement through the Arts. The Song Room

The Song Room received a three year grant for the Macquarie Group Foundation to investigate the efficacy of its interventions in improving social and educational outcomes for children in a range of high need target group areas participating in the program. These communities had been identified in earlier research by the Department of Justice and Attorney-General in NSW as having relatively high levels of juvenile crime.

This groundbreaking research has made an important advancement in demonstrating that arts education not only has intrinsic value, but when implemented with a structured innovative and long-term approach, it can also provide extrinsic benefits, such as improved school attendance, academic achievement across the curriculum as well as social and emotional wellbeing. (Caroline Aebersold)

The recommendations encourage policymakers that participation at all levels help close the gap in achievement of high and low-performing students through provision of an arts program.

10. The Status of Music Education

Australian Music Association: Submission to the Senate Inquiry into the Academic Standards of School Education

This comprehensive 38 page submission covers - The effectiveness of the current curriculum; Music and the linkage to numeracy and literacy; Music as tool for remedial learning and at risk students; Teaching Methods; Teacher Quality; Gifted Students; Music and the provision to students by schools of core knowledge and skills; Attitudinal change in the way knowledge is valued; International perspectives.

Some selected statements from the document

- The music products industry has a total sales value in excess of \$550 million per annum and employs in excess of 6,000 individuals directly and a further 1,000 or so as music teachers, coaches or mentors on a contract basis.
 - (A later statistical report shows that Australian copyright council report on Music, Film, and other copyright – based industries generated Aus\$93.2 billion in economic activity in 2011. Live performance reported \$1.3 billion in yearly revenue).
 - It is entirely possible that students complete a full thirteen years of education without ever being exposed or having the opportunity to participate in meaningful music education.
 - There was (in Victoria) no prescribed time allocated to music education at any point in the student’s primary or secondary school education.
 - Music has a low status within the curriculum, despite its proven links to intellectual development in the area of literacy and numeracy and its role in personal and social development.
 - Music education lacks in many instances a core place in the curriculum, access by students is haphazard and quality is highly variable. Music learning is frequently not of a continuous, sequential or developmental nature.
 - This low status and dis-continuous approach to music is contrary to the role music plays in the development of the individual, its place in the community and the scale both in value and employment opportunities of the industry.
 - Some of the research outcomes have shown that students who have access to music programs are: more connected with school and with teachers
- More self-confident and have high levels of self esteem
 - Likely to become managers of risk taking
 - Less likely to be involved in harassment and ethnic tension.
 - There are significant deficiencies in the training of teachers in music, particularly in the training of primary generalist teachers. (Latest research has found that the average hours of music training for a generalist teacher is 17 hours total).
 - Music education is highly valued by the community. However this is not reflected through resourcing, statutes within the curriculum or teacher education. Association’s research has shown that:
 - 91% of respondents agreed that all schools should offer an instrumental music education as part of their regular curriculum.
 - 86% of respondents agreed that music helps a child’s overall intellectual development
 - music education should be mandated by the states to ensure every child has an opportunity to study music in schools as supported by 87% of the population
 - The status afforded music in Australian schools lags significantly behind many other OECD countries.

Music education needs a national policy position ...

This policy position can be achieved through either of the following:

- music is recognised as a ‘core’ or discrete area of learning in the same way that English, mathematics and physical education are considered

or

- music is allocated a prescribed amount of curriculum time for all students from P to Year 9/10 and an elective area of study thereafter through to Year 12. In our opinion this allocation should be in the order of 50 hours per annum plus any additional extra – curriculum activity undertaken by students, should music continue to be bundled within arts education.

A strategic plan for the future of music education in Victorian schools has been drafted by sMAG and forwarded to the Victorian Curriculum and assessment authority. This is available on the sMAG Blog.

FUTURE OPTIMUM PROVISION OF MUSIC EDUCATION IN VICTORIAN SCHOOLS

8. Optimum governance and oversight arrangements

There is evidence to suggest that increasing the time spent in classroom based music education can improve academic and social development.

- Olson (2000) investigated the effects of extra Kodály-based music instruction and classroom teacher involvement on first grade students' music, reading, and math achievement and social skills' development. In addition to the regular weekly music class, the experimental group received extra Kodály-based music instruction for 30 minutes once a week with the classroom teacher remaining in the music classroom. The control group received only the 55 minute regular weekly Kodály-based music instruction with the classroom teacher absent. The results revealed significant differences between the two groups in music skills (pitch and rhythm), math achievement, reading achievement, and individual social skills assessment (class participation, cooperation with teacher, self-motivation, responsibility, and initiative). The behaviour/engagement rating also revealed significant differences between the two groups. Students receiving more Kodály-based music instruction gained in social as well as academic skills.
- Gardiner (2000) has published data on what appears to be an extended study of the Olson (2000) project, which also shows the relationship between music progress and progress in reading and math. In addition to positive correlations between music and academic achievement in the study, behaviours were found to change in association with the music training. These changes were detected from data reflecting measures of class participation, direction following, cooperation with the teacher, and cooperation with peers. Changes in personal behaviours also occurred and include improvement in self-motivation, self-esteem, responsibility and initiative.

This research justifies the case for regular music lessons in schools. Specifically, it highlights the need for music education which is delivered in an aural/vocal pedagogical style and with careful sequencing of conceptual introduction, development and practice. The importance of beginning this musical education from the earliest years is also paramount if the advantages of parallel intellectual and social development are to be harnessed.

Some models to evaluate

UK Music Education reforms in England 2001 - 2007

The Government Response to Darren Henley's Review of Music Education. Department of Education.

sMAG recommends the Music Review Committee examine, and implement (in a Victorian context), the recommendations listed below.

Recommendations from the Henley Review

1. Schools should provide children with a broad Music Education which includes performing, listening, reviewing and evaluating
2. Singing should be an important part of every child's life from Early Years through until at least Key Stage 3

3. All children at Key Stage 2 should have the opportunity to learn an instrument through whole class ensemble teaching. Ideally, this would be for a period of one year, but the barest minimum, one term of weekly tuition should be offered
4. There should be a clear progression route for children after the initial free opportunity for instrumental tuition is made available. This route would be means tested, with parents above an agreed income level expected to fund, or part fund, tuition.
21. Much primary school classroom teaching of music is provided by non-specialist teachers. The amount of time dedicated to music in most initial training courses is inadequate to create a workforce that is confident in its own ability to teach the subject in the classroom. It is recommended that a new minimum number of hours of ITT for primary music teachers be spent on the delivery of Music Education.
22. All primary schools should have access to a specialist music teacher.
32. It is recommended that the Department for Education examines how learning from the Sing Up and In harmony projects might be developed as a model for narrowing the gap in attainment through the use of the pupil premium. (The Singing Classroom in Victoria developed by AMUSE).
33. As part of the National Music Plan, further work should be undertaken to develop a national plan for the use of technology in the delivery of music education ... examine how technology could enable better teaching of music particularly in rural areas ...

**This publication can be downloaded online at: <http://publications.education.gov.uk/>
Search using the red:DfE-00012-2011**

The Response to the UK Report and subsequent policy action

- In 2000, the Government pledged that, over time, all pupils in primary schools who wished to would have the opportunity to learn an instrument. In 2004, delivering this commitment was the Government's flagship pledge to the Music Manifesto. Over 2004/5 and 2005/6, three million pounds was directed to Wider Opportunities-type programs and over 2006/7 and 2007/8 thirty one 5 million pounds was allocated to KS 2 music entitlement.
- A further funding boost (Au\$300 million over three years) was allocated to a new "Find Your Talent" program (pilot for 10 years for 2,000 schools with students getting five hours of culture a week; a strategic commissioning program; and a SHINE festival.

Every Primary School to become a Musical School

Launch of new singing campaign backed by record funding for music in schools involving a Au\$800 million government investment in choirs, orchestras, new instruments, performances and free lessons.

Music Instruction in Pre-service Education of Australian Primary School Teachers

The need for reform

An audit of 24 Australian universities conducted by the Music Council of Australia in 2008 found that on average, only 17 hours of mandatory training in music and music pedagogy is provided in pre-service training of Australian primary school teachers.

The issue of Teacher accreditation, teacher training accreditation and curriculum aims were also examined to determine where decisions about music in education originate. With findings that there was a preference to merge music into the subject "creative arts" reflects research pedagogies meeting budget-saving and timesaving requirements. The disadvantages were that music fundamentals have been overlooked and subsequently, benefits of music are almost inevitably lost.

Website: www.mca.org.au/web/content/view/102/6#audit

Generalist primary teachers' background and confidence in teaching music

There is significant research that confirms that most teachers have had little experience in music and other arts from their own education, and are not confident in teaching them. Lack of exposure to music through early primary and secondary schooling pose a significant challenge for arts educators in preparing pre-service generalists to teach music within a limited time-line which is in the vicinity of 17 hours. As a result a large number of primary schools have less than an adequate music program as teachers perceive they do not have the confidence, training, competence, resources, time or priority to implement an effective music program. (Department of Education, Science and Training [DEST], 2005; Russell-Bowie, 2002: Senate Environment, Recreation, Communication and the Arts References Committee, 1995).

Curriculum – ACARA

The amalgamation of music into one of 5 forms of 'The Arts' impacts greatly on the way the curriculum is written, which art form is implemented in a school, and the assessment processes.

In order to accommodate 5 Art forms, curriculum writers provide outlines in broad brush strokes. While this approach accommodates any setting, it effectively 'dumbs down' the music curriculum where approaches such as simply dancing interpretively to the music are sufficient for passing a level. The broad brush strokes do not adequately give credence to music as a language, a historical record, a social movement nor the clear skill sets that are so easily assessed and moderated by the A.M.E.B. Were the assessable benchmarks of understanding music (for instance) as a language, the clear sequential skill sets of writing the symbols that are interpreted as sound would a) empower the student to act independently of a teacher, reading music at will in the same way they read books b) allow for levels to be clearly taught to according to a curriculum and c) allow for assessment and moderation to be implemented at the same standards across Victoria. With the current amalgamation of the 5 Art forms all of this is lost.

With the amalgamation of music into 'The Arts', Principals choose one creative art form to implement in their community. Music is simply one option. This approach is oppositional to the UN right of the child, Australian and international research which indicates that every child needs to have music as a stand-alone subject from years K – 10.

Music curriculum needs to be written and assessed as a stand-alone subject. Parents expect to see a report mark for each art form as independent stand alone subjects and very much object to their child's results being amalgamated into one 'dot' on the timeline. Comprehensive music curriculum already exists – to write a sequential audio and notational linguistic curriculum would not be arduous – it has been done many times before. Models available in the UK, the use of the Internet and regional travelling teachers are all ways forward.

9. Optimum use of targeted funding

- Quality teacher training is essential in providing good music education. Music teachers must be confident and competent musicians. When using an aural/vocal approach they must be able to sing in tune, to discern intonation and rhythmic variations, to recreate music with the appropriate tone and artistic style. Music teachers must not only have the ability to communicate and develop these skills with their students, but they must have an extensive knowledge as to how to sequence learning materials and introduce musical concepts in a child-centred developmental framework. This ability and knowledge is not only essential to foster musically literate students, but also to develop the creativity inherent in all students.
- Creativity (improvising and composing using known rhythmic, melodic and harmonic concepts) is the pinnacle of artistic achievement for a musician. Learning to "think outside the box" and create new works of art which inspire and move our society will only happen with good music education. It is the responsibility of schools to provide this education as we cannot expect that private tuition will provide sufficient opportunities to develop creative skills. Private lessons are usually focused on the development of technical skills and performance levels.
- KMEIA offers a comprehensive course for music educators to develop all of the skills above. The Australian Kodály Certificate offers specialisation in the streams of Early Childhood, Primary, Secondary and Strings teaching. Certain state branches and Accredited course providers offer this qualification at various times of year and in various formats. Certain tertiary institutions presently recognise the Australian Kodály Certificate as credit towards further Post Graduate study in Education degrees.

- After maintaining the highest standards for music educators employed by the Department of Education in Victoria, it is then most important to provide funds for the employment of sufficient teachers to deliver music education in all primary and secondary schools and in early childhood centres.
- Funding towards educating teachers and towards providing teachers in schools would be the prime requirement to enable music education to flourish in Victoria.
- Further funding to support research into the benefits of music education would be beneficial in measuring and justifying initial investments.
- Funding is also needed to support the provision of proper facilities for classroom and instrumental music classes
- Professional development is needed to improve the understanding and attitude towards music education for Principals and class teachers.

10. Optimum balance of central mandates and supports

- In addition to recognising the training provided by tertiary institutions, it would be wise to recognise training provided by KMEIA in developing teachers with the skills to implement developmental sequential programmes in classroom and instrumental music.
- Universities need to support the field of specialist music teachers and provide proper training and resources for pre-service teachers
- Mandating learning audits of school music education programs will help to ensure that minimum levels of musical skill are achieved by students up to year 10 and 12. They will also identify the schools which need support in creating more equitable access for students to music education.

The following could be considered examples of best practice for the provision of quality music education programs in Victoria.

Scotch College, Hawthorn,
 Caulfield Grammar School
 Flemington Primary School
 Blackburn High School
 Firbank Grammar, Brighton
 Melbourne Grammar, Grimwade House
 St Michael's Grammar
 VCASS
 Eltham East Primary School

References

- Aiello, R. (2003). *The Importance of Metacognition Research in Music*. Paper presented at the 5th Triennial ESCOM Conference, Hanover, Germany.
- Barkóczi, I., & Pléh, C. (1977). *Music Makes a Difference: The Effect of Kodály's Musical Training on the Psychological Development of Elementary School Children* (S. Steiner & C. Pléh, Trans.). Kecskemét, Hungary: Zoltán Kodály Pedagogical Institute of Music.
- Bridges, D. (1980). Outcomes of a Developmental Music Program. *Bulletin of the Kodály Education Institute of Australia*, 5(1), 7.
- Choksy, L. (1999). *The Kodály Method I: Comprehensive Music Education* (3 ed.). Upper Saddle River, New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Choksy, L., Abramson, R. M., Gillespie, A. E., Woods, D., & York, F. (2001). *Teaching music in the twenty-first century* (2nd ed. ed.). Upper Saddle River, N.J. :: Prentice Hall.
- Forrai, K. (1980). The Influence of Music on the Development of Young Children: Music Research with Children between 6 and 40 Months. *Bulletin of the International Kodály Society*, 5(1), 15.
- Friss, G. (1966). The Music Primary School (B. Balogh, Z. Horn & P. Járdányi, Trans.). In F. Sándor (Ed.), *Musical Education in Hungary* (pp. 135-162). London: Barrie and Rockliff.
- Gadd, J. (2013). "The Joy of Singing" *Shine Magazine* (p.31-31). Australia: Department of Education and Early Childhood Development.
- Gardiner, M. F. (2000). Music, learning, and behavior: a case for mental stretching. *Journal for Learning Through Music*, 72-93.
- Gardiner, M. F. (2008). Music training, engagement with sequence, and the development of the natural number concept in young learners. *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, 31(06), 652-653.
- Gardiner, M. F., Fox, A., Knowles, F., & Jeffrey, D. (1996). Learning improved by arts training. *Nature*, 381(6580), 284-284.
- Geoghegan, N., & Mitchelmore, M. (1996). Possible Effects of Early Childhood Music on Mathematical Achievement. *Australian Research in Early Childhood Education*, 1, 57-64.
- Gromko, J. E. (2005). The Effect of Music Instruction on Phonemic Awareness in Beginning Readers. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 53(3), 199-209.
- Hanson, M. (2001). *An investigation of the effects of sequenced Kodaly literacy-based music instruction on the spatial reasoning skills of kindergarten students*. University of St. Thomas, St. Paul, MN.
- Hoermann, D. B., & Herbert, G. F. (1979). Report and Evaluation: A Developmental Programme of Music Education for Primary School (Kodaly-based). Brookvale, NSW: Dominie.
- Houlahan, M., & Tacka, P. (1998). *Zoltán Kodály: A Guide to Research*. New York: Garland Pub.
- Houlahan, M., & Tacka, P. (2008). *Kodály Today: A Cognitive Approach to Elementary Music Education*: Oxford University Press.
- Hurwitz, I., Wolff, P. H., Bortnick, B. D., & Kokas, K. (1975). Nonmusical Effects of the Kodaly Music Curriculum in Primary Grade Children. *Journal of Learning Disabilities*, 8(3), 167-174.
- Ittész, M. (2006). *Zoltán Kodály, In Retrospect*. Kecskemét, Hungary: Zoltán Kodály Pedagogical Institute of Music.
- Kalmár, M. (1982). The effects of music education based on Kodaly's directives in nursery school children: From a psychologist's point of view. . *Psychology of Music*(Special Issue), 63-68.

- Kokas, K. (1969). Psychological Testing in Hungarian Music Education. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 17(1), 125-134.
- Laczó, Z. (1985). The Nonmusical Outcomes of Music Education: Influence on Intelligence? *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*(85), 109-118.
- Levitin, D. (2006). *This is Your Brain on Music*. Atlantic Books, London
- Olson, E. K. B. (2000). *The effect of extra Kodaly-based music instruction and classroom teacher involvement of Powderhorn School first-grade students' music, reading, and math achievement and social skills development*. (M.A.), University of St. Thomas, Minnesota.
- Peterson, E. M. (1986). *Transfer effects from music literacy training within a Kodaly curricular framework to achievement in language reading*. (Master of Music), University of Calgary, Calgary, Alberta.
- Pozos, R. R. (1980). Evaluation Report : Kodály Music Program: Holy Names College and the San José Unified School District. Oakland CA, USA: Holy Names College.
- Schellenberg, E. G. (2004). Music Lessons Enhance IQ. *Psychological Science*, 15(8), 511-514.
- Seidel, S., Tishman, S., Winner, E., Hetland, L., & Palmer, P. (2009). *The qualities of quality: Understanding excellence in arts education*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Graduate School of Education, Project Zero.
- Wolff, K. L. (1978). The Nonmusical Outcomes of Music Education: A Review of the Literature. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*(55), 27.