

TRANSCRIPT

LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY ENVIRONMENT AND PLANNING COMMITTEE

Inquiry into Tackling Climate Change in Victorian Communities

Warrnambool—Thursday, 21 November 2019

MEMBERS

Mr Darren Cheeseman—Chair

Mr David Morris—Deputy Chair

Mr Will Fowles

Ms Danielle Green

Mr Paul Hamer

Mr Tim McCurdy

Mr Tim Smith

WITNESSES

Cr Tony Herbert, Mayor, and

Ms Jodie McNamara, Manager City Strategy and Development, Warrnambool City Council.

The CHAIR: Welcome to the Warrnambool public hearing for the Inquiry into Tackling Climate Change in Victorian Communities. I would like to extend a welcome to any members of the public and the media present here today, and I would like to acknowledge Roma Britnell, who is of course the local sitting MP. This is one of several public hearings that the Environment and Planning Committee is conducting to inform itself about the issues relevant to the Inquiry. I would like to just run through some important formalities before we begin. All evidence taken today will be recorded by Hansard and is protected by parliamentary privilege. This means that no legal action can be taken against you in relation to the evidence that you give. However, this protection does not apply to comments made outside the hearing, even if they are restating what you said during the hearing. You will receive a draft transcript of your evidence in the next week or so for you to check and approve. Corrected transcripts are published on the Committee's website and may be quoted from in our final report. Thank you for making the time to meet with the Committee today. Could each of you please state your full name and title before beginning your presentation?

Cr HERBERT: Thank you, Mr Chair. Tony Herbert, Mayor of the City of Warrnambool.

Ms McNAMARA: And Jodie McNamara, Manager of City Strategy and Development for Warrnambool city.

The CHAIR: Fantastic. Over to you.

Cr HERBERT: I will be the main presenter this morning. Jodie is here to accompany me for any very technical questions that anyone may have. Thanks for the opportunity to provide a submission to the Inquiry into Tackling Climate Change in Victorian Communities. Our goal is that Warrnambool will be the most environmentally sustainable regional city in Australia. That may be a substantial goal, but we have just been crowned the most livable city in Australia, so we aim high. Warrnambool city is located in south-west Victoria and is bounded by the ocean to its south, and east and west by the Hopkins and Merri rivers respectively. Both rivers and their tributaries extend across the northern parts of the municipality and into the surrounding Moyne shire. Warrnambool plays an important regional role in terms of service provision to its surrounding rural neighbours in the form of health, education, commerce, industry and recreation. Warrnambool considers itself to be a strong advocate for climate resilience and adaptation and has over the past few years undertaken strong strategic work to further bolster its ability and strength in this area. Most recently at its meeting of 7 October 2019 council also resolved the following motion:

That the Warrnambool City Council:

1. Recognises that we are in a state of climate emergency that requires urgent action by all levels of government, including local council;
2. Notes the link between this motion and strategies in our Council's W2040 and Green plan;
3. Notes the successful motion to the Municipal Association Victoria (MAV) May 2017 to recognise that we are in a state of "climate emergency" that requires urgent action by all levels of government, including local councils;
4. Acknowledges that our region will be further affected by this climate emergency, including extreme weather events, bushfires and sea level rise;
5. Writes to the State Premier and Prime Minister including information to do with Warrnambool City Council's climate action record to date, urging them and their Governments to:
 - (a) declare a climate emergency and
 - (b) back this up with legislated programs to drive emergency action to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and meet or exceed the Paris Agreement targets and facilitate urgent action on coastal management and climate change adaptation.

The current strategic work undertaken with direct reference to climate change preparedness and awareness includes the council plan, the community plan W2040 and *Green Warrnambool*.

Warrnambool City Council is committed to tackling climate change and aspires to become the most environmental regional city in Australia. This vision, as we know, is ambitious. But it reflects the community aspirations as set out in our 2040 plan, our community plan, our council plan and *Green Warrnambool*—council's strategic direction to address issues confronting the municipality. These issues include the health of our waterways and coast; land, air and water pollution; biodiversity and conserving our natural environment. Climate change, population growth and consumption patterns will affect us; however, as a creative and resilient regional city we aim to provide local responses to the issues facing the community.

Warrnambool's council plan, which was revised in 2019, provides the following relevant objectives. The first one: sustain, enhance and protect the natural environment. Pillars contained within the objective include specific reference to preparedness for climate change, options for waste minimisation and protected waterways, coast and land.

Warrnambool's community plan 2040 provides the following relevant pillar: that Warrnambool will be Australia's most livable city. *Green Warrnambool* was adopted by council in 2018 and sets the following goals. The first one is 'Zero Warrnambool': as a regional city we demonstrate innovative, smart solutions to achieve zero net emissions for a renewable future. The second goal is 'Adaptable Warrnambool': we will adapt to the impacts of climate change. The third goal is 'Wise Warrnambool': we are a wise city that wastes not. Number 4, 'Naturally Warrnambool': we enjoy, love, respect and care for our natural environment. The fifth goal is 'Blue Warrnambool': water is for life. The sixth goal is 'Green Warrnambool': we will become a city in nature.

All six goals and their subsequent actions have a link to climate change. They also identify what the community and Warrnambool City Council are doing now and aspire to do over the coming years to tackle climate change. Of most relevance to this Inquiry is Adaptable Warrnambool and how we will adapt to the impacts of climate change, where it is acknowledged that by working together we will be prepared, adept and resilient in the face of climate change challenges. Our institutions, agencies, universities, industries, businesses and community leaders will partner to develop the world's best responses.

Climate change is the most pressing economic and environmental issue of our time, and council acknowledges the need to tackle the root causes of climate change. Warrnambool faces four key climate change risks. The first one is less rainfall and more chance of drought; the second risk, extreme heatwaves and bushfires; the third risk, more intense rainfall and windstorms; the fourth risk, sea level rises, inundation and erosion.

Warrnambool City Council has progressed the following actions and projects relevant to tackling climate change. Action one is the Warrnambool *Climate Change Action Plan* adopted in 2012, which outlines a range of actions to tackle climate change, including the commitment of Warrnambool City Council to reduce greenhouse gas emissions by 30 per cent from 2012 levels by 2020. Action two: council has reduced its carbon emissions by 22 per cent from the 2012 levels; however, council will further need to reduce or offset 700 tonnes of CO₂ next year in order to meet the 2020 target emissions. We are rolling out this year stage two of our street lighting upgrade, and it is envisaged that this will give us the extra 8 per cent for us to meet those targets. Warrnambool City Council's emission profile has been developed in-house to monitor council's energy use and identify areas to reduce consumption and emissions. The monitoring has identified a number of areas where reductions can be achieved, and they include the installation of solar panels on council facilities and stage two of the Smart Lighting project.

Significant investment and funding are required to achieve the target of zero net emissions by 2040. It will require substantial structural, economic and policy change to drive an increase in energy efficiency, decrease the use of carbon-intensive fuel sources and offset any remaining emissions. To further bolster the reduction in emissions and improve environmentally sustainable Warrnambool, Warrnambool City Council has commenced the following initiatives. Initiative one is the development of a sustainable buildings policy for council owned and managed buildings. Initiative two is a commitment of 40 per cent of council's electricity usage to the local government renewable energy power purchase agreement. Initiative three: commence stage two of the Smart

Lighting project. Initiative four: partner in the development of *Charging the Regions*, the electric vehicle strategy.

Since 2012 the Warrnambool-South Barwon region has benefited from the work of the Climate Resilient Communities project in planning for and adapting to climate change. The region has achieved greater preparedness and increased resilience in our communities as a result of this proactive collaboration amongst 10 councils, the Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning, two catchment management authorities and local water authorities, among others.

A wide range of initiatives was undertaken by the Climate Resilient Communities project, including the delivery of adaptation plans to all councils within the region, as well as beginning the process of implementing priority actions identified in the plans and embedding the learning within each organisation. The South West Climate Change Portal is a legacy of this project and aims to provide regionally specific climate change information that can be used to adapt to a changing climate. The South West Climate Change Portal is available on the website.

The Climate Resilient Community's project included the development of a Warrnambool climate change adaptation plan, which outlines council's approach to managing the impacts of prioritised climate risks. These risks have been embedded into council's risk register. The adaptation plan will be incorporated into the review of the Warrnambool *Climate Change Action Plan*, which is due for review in 2020.

In 2017 the Barwon South West Local Coastal Hazard Assessment phase 1 scoping paper was undertaken to build a detailed view of the South Barwon region's existing and future coastal hazards and to prioritise risks for future modelling. This regional project was led by the Warrnambool City Council in partnership with the regional coastal LGAs and other agencies to provide a first phase of a multistage process to implement the Victorian coastal hazard planning process. Phase two is a third-pass risk assessment and is subject to funding.

Low carbon neighbourhood: Warrnambool is partnering with the Victorian Planning Authority in its development of a future urban growth area—east of Aberline Road—in Warrnambool's north-east corridor. The VPA—and we acknowledge the submission by the VPA, which recognises the same topic—have embraced Warrnambool's potential to deliver a pilot project for a low or zero carbon precinct. The VPA has been integral in its support, coordination, facilitation and work with landowners and industry to advance the precinct in this way.

Mr FOWLES: And is that precinct predominantly housing, is it? Yes.

Cr HERBERT: Do you want to add anything further on that, Jodie?

Ms McNAMARA: No, that's fine.

Cr HERBERT: Due to Warrnambool's estuarine environment, with two river mouths at the ocean susceptible to tidal and extreme storm influence, priority is needed to understand, map and mitigate flood impacts on Warrnambool's urban environment. Our targets are ambitious and will require a cultural shift in how we live our lives and develop our city. It will take significant commitment and investment across all sectors and will require innovative solutions, including some of which we may be early adopters.

Green Warrnambool acknowledges the partnerships required with agencies, industry and the community and that to achieve the vision, goals and actions of this strategy, a collaborative effort is essential along with appropriate resources and funding to tackle climate change.

The Victorian Government's support with provision and allocation of resources, funding and technical knowledge to assist in tackling climate change is appreciated. Technical skills and experience related to issues of climate change has been identified as a gap in local government knowledge and affordability. Warrnambool has a strong history of partnering with, coordinating and project managing across municipal boundaries in delivering joint-funded projects. Consideration of a single central agency delivery model that ensures a coordinated and multidisciplinary approach to mitigation and adaptation would serve the region well. Warrnambool City Council would become a centre of excellence or a knowledge hub in the municipality, and we would be happy to host and assist in the development of this critical resource.

The CHAIR: Thank you, Tony. That was an exceptionally detailed presentation. I am sure a number of my colleagues will have questions, but I might start off with respect to council's infrastructure base. Obviously local government are significant managers of public infrastructure and of course climate change presents a significant challenge in terms of that infrastructure base. We have heard evidence from other councils that they are only just starting to get their heads around what a drying climate might mean. The consequences of climate change might be more intense storm activities and the like, which means that our drainage infrastructure may need to be enhanced to carry more water. When you are replacing existing infrastructure in existing settlements, is your council looking to increase the capacity of that infrastructure to carry water, and when you are building new communities—and you have indicated one already—are you putting in place additional capacity that in the past you may not have required?

Cr HERBERT: Thanks for the question, Mr Chair, I think an example of that in an already existing community is the flood-mitigation work that council has undertaken in the last couple of years that it has partnered with the catchment management authority. Council has done a lot of flood mapping and worked out that there were a significant number of properties that were regularly at risk. Through funding through the CMA and assisting with the CMA we have been able to put these flood-mitigating barriers into areas of residential activity along the Merri River, which has greatly increased the safety capacity of this area. Prior to the work being undertaken there were about 146 properties that would regularly flood in a flood-event storm. With the work undertaken and the collaboration with the CMA, we are down to about 13 properties. So it has been a significant change to an already existing community.

The CHAIR: Yes, and no doubt costing a significant amount of money to increase the capacity of the drainage system there. Obviously the council has a very beautiful waterfront. I would imagine that there are a number of different entities that are the land managers. Is that providing significant challenges in terms of dealing with sea level rise and coastal inundation—some of those challenges?

Ms McNAMARA: Thanks for the question. That is definitely a challenge for us as part of the committee of management for managing most of the coastal area along Warrnambool's foreshore, in coordinating all those entities and managing particular assets along that foreshore. It is something that there is probably a bit of a lack of knowledge on, and there is definitely a gap analysis that needs to be done in understanding what those impacts might be.

The CHAIR: And perhaps just one final one on that: do you think it might be useful for that kind of gap analysis to be undertaken across the whole of the Victorian coastline? If you have had challenges, I am sure—in fact I know—other councils will have had similar challenges.

Ms McNAMARA: I would agree with that completely, and particularly the coastline does not just stick to municipal boundaries. It is a statewide matter, and we would benefit from knowledge from other municipalities as well.

Mr MORRIS: This is not what I was going to ask but just to follow up on that one—and first of all, good morning and thanks for coming to talk to us—just the management arrangements: Jodie, you mentioned that the council works with the committee of management for the majority of the land, but what are the other agencies involved and where are the boundaries?

Ms McNAMARA: Sure. Thank you for that question, and I will probably stand corrected. I probably should have brought a map, and I can provide a map which clearly articulates those boundaries. The council is the committee of management from the Hopkins River mouth around to the breakwater and nearly to the golf club, and then we have some parcels that are still Crown managed and then we go into a little piece of council managed again, and then we go into Crown, so it is a combination of Crown and council.

Mr MORRIS: And Parks has got management for Crown land involved?

Ms McNAMARA: Some of that, yes.

Mr MORRIS: What about the river itself? What are the management arrangements for that?

Ms McNAMARA: Council has a committee of management through there but the catchment management authority do have responsibility on that as well.

Mr MORRIS: All right. Going back to what I was going to ask, the 2040 deadline for zero is an interesting deadline, and a little different. I am just wondering how you settled on that date?

Ms McNAMARA: It was community driven. When we undertook our community plan and its engagement last year it was a nominal date that was selected by the community, and I guess if we roll into 2020 next year it is another 20 years of council's future planning.

Mr MORRIS: And in terms of the planning for that, have you yet established benchmarks and a process to get there that you can check your progress against?

Ms McNAMARA: *Green Warrnambool*, the main action plan, out of that we derive some check-in dates. We have a particular interim goal date of 2026, and we have our targets set within that. I will provide a copy of the *Green Warrnambool* plan to the Committee.

Mr MORRIS: That would be great.

The CHAIR: Fantastic. I might just ask, so climate change obviously presents a number of challenges. This broadly is a very significant agricultural district. That will presumably mean that farming practices might need to change. There are obviously clearly going to be potential farming enterprises from Northern Victoria who may wish to migrate further south. Has council started thinking about what economic opportunities might actually come from that? I think there are some positives from climate change locally. Have you got some strategies in place that identify what new agricultural practices might become viable here that previously have not been?

Cr HERBERT: Thanks for that question again, Mr Chair. Warrnambool City Council, through its collaboration with the Great South Coast Group of councils—of Corangamite, Moyne, Southern Grampians and Glenelg, and which Warrnambool is a part of—has commissioned a projects report that is like a futures report, and the interim draft has come back and we have seen it at a Great South Coast board-level screening. It has really presented the significant opportunities that this area has from an agricultural perspective. We have considerable underground water benefits, probably like nothing else in the country, and a lot of the irrigation rights that have been taken up historically are about 60 per cent used to capacity at the moment. So there is significant opportunity, the futures report believes, in that more intense horticultural-type agricultural activity rather than just relying on large-scale broadacre farming. So I think it is our water potential and our underground water potential that is a significant opportunity for us moving into the future.

Mr HAMER: Out of that, I was about to ask exactly the same question. Historically I have always seen the south-west region as having the most reliable rainfall in the state. Is that something that has been changing or the experts are saying has been also changing, or is it predicted to change in terms of the reliability? Clearly across some other parts of the state that has been identified—drying climate—but already those parts are sort of traditionally known as having quite large variations in terms of their best years and their worst years. Is that happening to an extent down here as well or is it forecast to occur over the next 20, 30 years?

Cr HERBERT: I might ask Jodie to assist me with that. I think from probably more anecdotal experience I believe that the growing seasons are contracting. There is probably not a year after year where it is a normal growing season. There are variances and variations. I am not over that technically at all. It is probably more anecdotal sort of situations. I do not know if you have got anything further to add, Jodie?

Ms McNAMARA: Thank you. I might take that on notice and get some data through to you if that helps the Committee at all.

Mr HAMER: It certainly does.

Ms McNAMARA: What we have experienced recently, though, is out of season storm events which I guess are quite extreme and short lived and that then leads to the infrastructure topic that we were talking about earlier. But I can get some detailed information for you on that.

Mr HAMER: Just going back to the Chair's point about the opportunities, Warrnambool obviously would not have an enormous amount of rural land—

Cr HERBERT: No.

Mr HAMER: because it is quite a small council, but then being the regional centre having that opportunity to value add and more from food processing and that type of thing. Is that part of that discussion in that futures report?

Cr HERBERT: Yes, definitely. The futures report is highlighting the significant benefit of us producing vast amounts of raw product—dry milk powder and things like that—but it is also suggesting this value-added product that we are probably not famous for. Given the purity of conditions, the significant rainfall but also the significant underground water catchments that we have, there is that opportunity to do those more value-added products that we are probably not known for at the moment.

Mr HAMER: What do you think would be needed for that? What is preventing that from happening?

Cr HERBERT: I think it is probably more historical farming practice and I think it is potentially those northern opportunities that might be coming down south and challenging the way that we have done things for many decades. In this futures study there has been quite a comparison between what they are doing in the Netherlands agriculturally compared to the Great South Coast region—similar in size, similar land under cultivation, but the significant difference in outcome and output and these high value-added products that they are famous for we are probably just exploring at the moment.

Mr FOWLES: Thank you for your presentation. It is great to see a regional council being so focused and progressive in relation to some of these matters. I am interested in a few issues. The first is just on the stationary energy side. We have heard a lot of evidence around solar projects particularly, but this is a pretty windy and wet part of the world. What has the community response been to wind projects? I know they have been contentious in other parts of the state but interested to get your take on those.

Ms McNAMARA: Thank you. I will answer that one. Warrnambool probably is central to the surrounding municipalities and their role in the large infrastructure projects. I guess the role that we play is around housing, health, education that comes with the influx of those projects associated with their construction. That is sort of the role that we play in that form.

Mr FOWLES: So there are no wind projects obviously within your municipal boundaries, but as we head west there are a number of them. Do you have a sense that those things, and perhaps I will ask you to speak a little bit beyond the patch, are well received within in the community, or are they highly contentious? Are they matters that are raised with you, Mayor, as a civic leader?

Cr HERBERT: I go away with the other mayors of other regional councils. We have just had a Municipal Association of Victoria annual general assembly, and these issues of course are raised quite significantly. What I have heard from other neighbouring mayors is that the projects are not received negatively, but from where I sit and from what I understand one of their greatest concerns is the crisscrossing of powerlines to enable the electricity to get from the wind farms into the main powerlines.

Mr FOWLES: Yes, the grid.

Cr HERBERT: So that is probably where they are most concerned: that the landscape is going to be crisscrossed. They call it a spider web of infrastructure and of powerlines getting it to the grid. They have also seen a bit of a shift in the power companies to not just offering incentives for the owners of the land that the windfarm may be on but the windfarm companies are offering incentives for the community. I am talking financial incentives for the community, which I think have been received much better than just the farmer benefiting from supply of his land.

Mr FOWLES: Yes, sure thing. If I can turn now to the 2020 review, if you could perhaps foreshadow what you are anticipating and what changes you think are likely to come out of that process and also address just whether mental health is going to feature in that. We have taken evidence around the state from communities

like this one where people are more likely to be confronted with the daily realities of climate change because they are smelling the smoke or watching the sea or whatever rather than those in much more concentrated urban areas, whether the mental health impacts are things that you are seeing. We have heard terms like ‘climate grief’ enter the lexicon.

Cr HERBERT: At the council meeting where we approved the climate emergency motion a lot of the discussion around the council chamber was the word ‘emergency’ creating this level of anxiety and fear. There were a few councils that talked about it being classified maybe more as a ‘climate priority’, so we are very much aware that that can create some level of anxiety among certain groups of people. Jodie, did you want to comment more on the review in 2020?

Ms McNAMARA: I think that is a really good pick-up for us to take into account. The review of the climate adaptation plan should definitely take that into account, amongst other things that we know that we need to get on with.

Mr FOWLES: Thank you.

The CHAIR: I might just ask a couple more questions whilst Danielle gets herself collected. She may have a couple of questions as well. I am just interested to know, and I know you went through some of this, the council as an entity—have you measured your own internal carbon footprint, and what particular steps are you putting in place to reduce that carbon footprint? And what level of support potentially could be provided by the Parliament to assist councils in reducing their internal carbon footprint?

Ms McNAMARA: Thank you for the question. Our current activities to date, we have developed an internal monitoring program which starts to look at our energy costs to be identifying which particular areas of council buildings and facilities are causing the most energy draining results. Once we get the final feedback from that we will be able to understand where to direct our energy to.

Current programs that we have in place anyway are starting to implement solar panels on some of our buildings. Our sustainable buildings policy is starting to be developed—not yet adopted by council, but we are in the early phases. That will look at starting to embed sustainable principles into any new building refits or any new buildings that are being done, particularly around our sportsgrounds and that sort of thing. We are starting to look at an efficient vehicle policy and purchase agreement there. So just a few things that we are starting to chip away at. Of course there is a money and funding gap that we have, but they are the early things that we are starting to do.

The CHAIR: Okay, and council—all councils, but particularly yours I would imagine—is a significant procurer of services. Are you starting to look at your supply chains, those that provide services to the council, in terms of what their carbon footprint is, whether they, as entities tendering for your work, are developing plans to make sure that they are as sustainable as possible from a climate change perspective? Is that work yet to be done? Is that—

Ms McNAMARA: Yes. We have started in an ad hoc way, not in a broad policy sense. Any services that we procure we do start to look at those things within our tendering documents and assessments. But it is definitely an area that we feel we need to work more thoroughly on.

Ms GREEN: Look, I apologise for my delay. I came from Horsham this morning and there was a significant number of wind component—

The CHAIR: Movements.

Ms GREEN: Yes, under construction, like blades, the central motor and towers along the road. I thought it was really interesting to contemplate. And I should say, as someone who grew up in Warrnambool, I am absolutely positive I have never been in the Warrnambool Hotel at 10.00 am before. I would just like that noted.

Mr FOWLES: You’ve woken up here before, come on.

Ms GREEN: Except I actually did book in and stay here once many years ago with my sisters. So no, I have told a fib, but I have spent many happy occasions in this establishment, in the evenings mainly.

But I think probably just some reflections and some suggestions really as someone who grew up here. When we heard evidence down in Paynesville and Bairnsdale with the council down there I was really impressed with some of the work that they were doing, particularly because they have got the same sort of challenges with coastal erosion with what you might do in planning and development close to waterways. They have got lakes, you have got two rivers here. They presented a really, really impressive document to home owners and potential investors. I thought it was one of the best, having been involved in CFA and emergency services myself. But it was really, really good advice. I commended them on it and I have since told emergency service personnel about it. I think, and you touched on it in your presentation with the whole climate emergency and passing a resolution about that, it is the balance between panicking people and giving them information that shows that they can adapt.

Jodie, you also mentioned funding gaps and concerns. When we went to Bendigo, which is obviously the other side of the Divide, they showed us what challenges they were doing in terms of keeping people active in their stadiums. They have installed solar. In my own community in Diamond Creek, where I live now, they have installed solar and batteries there. So not only is it saving the local council money—yes, there is an investment in the front, but it has never been cheaper to borrow than at the moment—but the other thing that our community is looking at is that it then becomes a really good demonstration project for other businesses who then go, ‘Oh, hang on a minute, we might put solar and batteries there’. So not only is it saving you money on your energy costs but reducing your carbon footprint, the demonstration there. But also at the Community Bank Stadium in Diamond Creek, it will mean that they have 8 to 10 hours of power so that they can use it as an emergency response centre. It has been a really quite clever funding project. It was actually funded through the Victorian Government Sustainability Fund.

Ms McNAMARA: Fantastic.

Ms GREEN: So it might be worthwhile looking at those sorts of things.

Ms McNAMARA: Thank you. Appreciate that.

Mr FOWLES: One more. Part of the role of the Committee is law reform. Are there any reflections out of the experience of working with the catchment management authority about ways in which those relationships could work better or the ease or otherwise of undertaking projects jointly where you have got those kind of jurisdictional lines being crossed?

Ms McNAMARA: If I may, we find that the CMA have been really great to work with at a local level here. We would not have been able to do some of our flood modelling without their assistance, and most recently we benefited from one of their funding rollouts which enabled us to do that most recent flood modelling. In a statutory sense of course they do have their responsibilities, which we respect. But in terms of that relationship and understanding each other, it is good.

The CHAIR: Thank you.

Cr HERBERT: Thank you.

The CHAIR: No worries. Thank you for your time; I appreciate it.

Ms McNAMARA: Thank you.

Witnesses withdrew.